

Kari A. Bingen
Deputy Under Secretary of Defense for Intelligence
Statement for the Record "Current Status of Diversity across the Intelligence Community"
Before the House Permanent Select Committee on Intelligence
May 23, 2019

Chairman Schiff, Ranking Member Nunes, and distinguished members of the Committee, it is a privilege to testify today on the current status of diversity in the Intelligence Community, and specifically on the status of diversity across the Defense Intelligence Enterprise (DIE). This is an issue of importance to the Department of Defense (DoD), to Under Secretary of Defense for Intelligence (USD(I)), Joe Kernan, and an issue that I am personally passionate about.

In the simplest of terms, our defense intelligence mission demands a diverse workforce. After all, our job is to understand others: other countries, their cultures, capabilities, and ways of thinking. Our human sources must understand and blend into foreign environments. Our linguists and analysts must appreciate nuances in foreign dialects and cultural norms to understand intent. We have extensive intelligence relationships with a broad array of foreign partners, and we fight in coalitions. So diversity in backgrounds, ethnicity, gender, and in other areas across our ranks and in our thinking is vitally important to our mission success.

The United States has not faced a more diverse and complex array of challenges since World War II. The technical advantage that the United States has maintained for decades is eroding. No one demographic – whether ethnicity, gender, age, or other group – has the market cornered on the brainpower, critical thinking, and hard work necessary to address these challenges. The Department and the Intelligence Community (IC) need talent. We need the best and brightest, from all corners of our country, across a diverse set of backgrounds, experiences, and skillsets, willing to serve our Nation, to work as a team, and to provide our policymakers and warfighters with the intelligence to maintain our strategic advantage.

The DIE has made steady progress in advancing diversity and inclusion across the workforce, but there are still trends of concern and challenges, particularly when we compare ourselves to external benchmarks in the Federal workforce or private sector. Today, I will outline DIE workforce trends, areas of success, outstanding challenges, and ways we are addressing those challenges, focusing on the four key areas of recruitment, talent development, retention, and enabling capabilities.

DIE WORKFORCE LANDSCAPE

The National Defense Strategy (NDS) states that we must have “a motivated, diverse, and highly skilled civilian workforce.” It emphasizes talent management, education and training, the need for new skills, and exploring non-traditional pathways and partners to bring critical skills into service. DoD policy on “Diversity Management and Equal Opportunity in the DoD” provides an overarching framework for addressing unlawful discrimination and promoting equal opportunity, diversity, and inclusion, and there are a number of diversity programs across the Department and within each of the Military Departments’ diversity strategies.

The DIE workforce is comprised of 187,000 personnel, spanning military and civilian personnel across the three combat support agencies, the National Reconnaissance Office (NRO), and the intelligence components in the Military Departments and Combatant Commands. Of this total workforce, over 56,000 are civilian employees covered by the Defense Civilian Intelligence Personnel System (DCIPS), which is overseen by the Under Secretary of Defense for Intelligence. The Military Departments play a critical role in executing DoD guidance for both uniformed service members and civilian intelligence personnel.

Overall, IC and DIE demographic diversity has steadily increased over time, particularly from 2010 to 2018, when the community has consistently collected general workforce data¹:

- The representation of women in the IC workforce increased for the first time in the last four years, from 38.5% to 38.8% between Fiscal Year (FY) 2017 and FY18.
 - Women made up 41.2% of new hires in FY18, representing an increase from 38.8% in FY17.
 - Women made up 37.3% of IC managers and supervisors, which was an increase from 36.3%.
- Minority representation in the IC workforce is now at 26.2%, an increase from 25.5% in FY17.
 - Across the Military Departments from 2010 to 2018, the Navy and Marine Corps increased from 25.2% to 28.1%, the Army increased from 24.3% to 26.7%, and the Air Force increased from 27.2% to 27.7%.
 - Across the combat support agencies and NRO, minority representation grew from 2010 to 2018: the Defense Intelligence Agency (DIA) increased from 30.3 % to 34.7%, the National Geospatial-Intelligence Agency (NGA) increased from 21.5% to 26.5%, and the National Security Agency (NSA) increased from 18.9% to 23.4%.
- The representation of Persons with Disabilities (PWD) increased across the IC and DIE, with the Military Departments roughly matching the federal benchmark of 18%.
 - During the 2010 to 2018 timeframe, PWD representation in the Air Force increased from 7.8% to 21.8%, the Navy and Marine Corps increased from 8.6% to 16.2%, and the Army increased from 11.4% to 18.7%. These trends are due, in large part, to the military intelligence components' efforts to recruit wounded warriors and disabled veterans.

However, during this same period, there are some trends in the workforce data that require additional focus:

¹ Office of the Director of National Intelligence, "Annual Demographic Report: Fiscal Year 2018," and data from the Human Capital Management Office within the Office of the Under Secretary of Defense for Intelligence.

- Across the Military Departments, female representation in defense intelligence decreased between 2010 and 2018, with the Army decreasing from 33.6% to 27.6%, Navy and Marine Corps decreasing from 35.6% to 32.4%, and the Air Force decreasing from 31.0% to 26.2%.
- In FY18, the attrition of women, minorities, and PWD occurred at higher rates than our ability to recruit women, minorities, and PWD into the workforce, specifically in the Military Departments.
- Despite the increase in representation from FY17 to FY18, minorities, women, and PWD continued to be less represented at the higher pay grades, from GS/GG-13 to senior pay levels.

The DIE components recognize these challenges and are taking proactive steps to understand the key drivers behind them, and to develop and implement strategies and targeted initiatives to address them. In parallel, we are working collaboratively across the IC and DIE to collect more comprehensive workforce data, establish better reporting metrics, and develop assessment tools to measure the impact of specific initiatives.

For example, NGA has implemented a data-driven approach to transform its workforce strategy and changed its recruiting strategy to align its university recruitment program to its needed skillsets and to access a more diverse applicant pool.

RECRUITMENT

A more diverse, inclusive workforce starts with recruitment, specifically across our Nation's universities. We want to bring in and cultivate a large pool of diverse employees that become our mission experts, managers and supervisors, and senior leaders. As noted in the NDS, the DoD also has a need for greater science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) talent, including information experts, data scientists, computer programmers, basic science researchers, and engineers.

DIE components are leveraging long-standing student programs, expanding their internship programs, and also implementing more targeted and direct campus recruiting efforts to attract and hire diverse talent.

- The IC's Stokes Educational Scholarship Program provides undergraduates, particularly minority students, with college scholarships, summer internship opportunities, and IC employment upon graduation. The NSA, in particular, has leveraged the Stokes program and authority to recruit computer science and computer/electrical engineering majors. Last year, NSA had a 100% conversion rate where all its Stokes scholars became NSA employees.
- NGA's student internship program has become more focused, and as a result minority representation has increased 24% since 2016, with minorities comprising 41% and women comprising 50% of all new student interns in FY18. NSA and NGA are models for focusing

on Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HCBUs), Hispanic Serving Institutions, and other underrepresented groups and underserved areas.

- DIA has expanded its internship program, increasing from 150 to 350 students per year. Last year over 80% of these interns were hired into the DIA workforce.
- DIA leads the Wounded Warrior internship program within the IC, placing injured, ill, and wounded Service members in a variety of internships across the IC based on their military skillsets, experience, and interests. The Air Force has expanded its recruitment efforts regarding disabled veterans.
- Naval Intelligence has increased its direct recruiting from universities, including HCBUs, and the Universities of Puerto Rico and Hawaii. It has increased Hispanic/Latino new hires by 2.5%, and more than 50% of its intern/entry-level hires in 2018 were women.

Within the Office of the Under Secretary of Defense for Intelligence (OUSDI), in collaboration with the Military Departments, we are experimenting with pilot programs to attract diverse talent and to be more competitive in compensation. For example:

- The Air Force established a pilot program at the National Air and Space Intelligence Center (NASIC) to create more flexibility in position descriptions (versus today's rigid requirement for a specific position and grade level) that allows for a wider range of applicants with broad skillsets and diverse backgrounds to apply.
- NSA has existing Title 10 authority for incentive pay in certain cyber and STEM areas to enable it to be more competitive in recruiting top talent. However, once these experts are in the door, NSA is challenged in retaining them due to federal civilian pay caps. We appreciate the Committee's support of legislation to address this in the Intelligence Authorization Act.

Recruitment of diverse civilian professionals for the military intelligence components remains a challenge, particularly in the Army, despite increased outreach to universities and industry groups with diverse applicant pools, greater use of social media, and other incentive tools. A deeper examination of the data, where it exists, is underway so that we understand the key drivers and are developing the right solutions to the right problems.

TALENT DEVELOPMENT

Recruitment efforts alone are not sufficient to sustain a diverse workforce across the DIE, at all levels and in all mission areas, that is truly reflective of America. We must actively support and build a "pipeline" of talent. Training, education, and career broadening opportunities are necessary to keep our workforce challenged and engaged, to set them up for promotion, and to keep us competitive with the private sector and other U.S. government organizations. Talent development, a consistent theme in our annual workforce climate surveys, demonstrates leadership commitment to fostering an inclusive environment and creates the career ladders necessary to create diverse applicant pools for senior level positions.

- Several DIE components have active career management processes that focus on building capabilities across their organizations and matching employee needs to appropriate training and education, developmental assignments within the organization or outside through joint duty opportunities. For example, both the Army and Air Force utilize career development plans for their civilian intelligence employees.
- Joint duty credit has been expanded across the DIE to provide an incentive for employees to pursue career broadening opportunities. This also benefits our Combatant Commands, which leverage the unique skillsets and diverse backgrounds that these intelligence professionals bring to the Commands.
- The DIE continues to expand its offering of higher education and tuition assistance programs, general professional development courses, intelligence-specific discipline training, and intelligence certifications. For example, the total number of geospatial intelligence (GEOINT) certifications issued across the DIE workforce, including all four military services, grew from 5,272 in FY15 to 13,382 in FY18.
- Several of the DIE components have increased diversity and inclusion training. For example, the Navy conducts training in “Championing Diversity, Unconscious Bias, and True Colors” for its naval intelligence workforce.
- Diversity and inclusion criteria are included in all DCIPS employees’ annual performance evaluations. For example, senior executives are required to demonstrate performance in recruitment, retention, and development of the talent needed to achieve a high quality workforce that reflects the diversity of the nation. NSA, in particular, has implemented advanced diversity and inclusion objectives for all senior executive leaders.

Promotion rates for minorities, women, and PWD remain a concern and, as noted above, may have contributed to underrepresentation at the higher pay grades from GS/GG-13 to senior pay levels. We continue to analyze what barriers to promotion opportunity may exist and to take action to remove these barriers. For example, we have instituted measures to increase hiring panel diversity, provide unconscious bias training, and expand talent development programs. This challenge has senior leader attention and we will continue with proactive efforts to develop diverse applicant pools who possess the skills necessary for senior level positions.

RETENTION

Beyond the onboarding and talent development efforts, our survey data shows that retention of our minority, female, and PWD talent is bolstered by greater services and support, including initiatives that promote greater work flexibility and a better work-life balance.

- All of the agencies have active affinity and employee resource groups that monitor the health of their represented groups, assist in providing mentoring and networking opportunities, focus on professional development, and represent their interests to leadership in the

organization. For example, Naval Intelligence has three established groups: Women's Leadership Forum, LGBTA, and Women in STEM.

- The DoD has expanded the ability of employees to telework from home and designated telework centers. Although challenging for intelligence professionals due to the classified nature of our work, several of our defense intelligence components (such as the Navy) have been able to take advantage of this and other flexible schedule initiatives.
- We are also seeking ways to increase flexibility for working mothers and new parents, recognizing that many private employers have begun providing longer periods of paid leave for parents following the birth or adoption of a child. The 25th Air Force established an Expectant Mothers Program to improve quality of life for working mothers. Spurred by NGA's initiative, OUSD(I) is working actively with the Office of Personnel Management (OPM) to identify ways to expand the use of leave sharing and leave bank programs for parental and other care-giving responsibilities.

Some of the growth in overall female and minority retention across the DIE can be attributed to hiring exceeding attrition, specifically in the defense agencies and NRO. However, retention remains a significant challenge among the Military Departments, where the opposite trend is occurring. This is particularly acute in the Army, which saw minorities represent 16.3% of FY18 total workforce hires, but 24.5% of its civilian attrition that year comprised were minorities. Similarly, females represented 29.2% of the Army's FY18 total workforce hires, but 31.6% of its civilian attrition that year was comprised of females. A deeper examination of the data, where it exists, coupled with exit interviews and workforce surveys, is required to understand these concerning trends.

ENABLING CAPABILITIES

There are a number of enabling capabilities that will help evolve DIE workforce management practices to entice high caliber, diverse talent. These efforts aim to understand the complexity of our workforce, improve hiring timeliness, and enhance the quality of life of our workforce.

- Clearance Reform. The DIE depends on a trusted workforce that can exchange, analyze, and communicate information critical to our national security. However, significant delays in obtaining appropriate clearances and antiquated processes hinder our ability to quickly bring in diverse talent. The recently signed Executive Order 13869, "Transferring Responsibility for Background Investigations to the Department of Defense," transfers background investigations (BI) to DoD effective October 1, 2019, and we are working in partnership with OPM to reduce the current BI backlog and modernize the process.
- Faster Onboarding. The DIE is experimenting with processes that will allow us to bring employees onboard faster with interim clearances, and to provide them with work at lower classification levels that allow them to contribute to mission and begin employment. NGA has been experimenting with this process for the past year, with signs of success. We are looking to implement a similar process as part of our NASIC pilot this summer.

Additionally, some DIE components are also making on-the-spot offers of conditional employment, a standard industry practice, to quickly capture top talent.

- **Government Application Process.** The IC and DIE is competing with a growing civilian market for the best talent across the nation. We are developing modern processes and tools to leverage technology to improve the hiring experience so we can effectively compete in an open market. For example, the IC Applicant Gateway is a tool under development to streamline, and create greater transparency into the application process. It will also facilitate both targeted recruiting supporting our diversity initiatives and sharing of applicant resumes across the IC. DIE organizations are increasingly leveraging social media platforms such as LinkedIn, Facebook, and Twitter, to convey openings, host virtual Job Fairs, and advertise their organizations to the newer generations of applicants.
- **Data and Data-driven Decision Aids.** While we have seen an increased focus on diversity and inclusion over the past decade, we lack fulsome data and data-driven decision aids to help us further understand the specific nature of the overarching minorities, women, and PWD trends, specifically in the Military Departments. For example, we lack an understanding of why female representation across the military intelligence components has decreased and any correlation of demographic or other factors to this decrease. This lack of root cause understanding makes mitigation options more challenging.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, thank you for holding this hearing and bringing this issue to the forefront. The success of our warfighters in the field and our policymakers here at home rests on superior intelligence information and capabilities, which in turn depends on our most important asset... our people. Our defense intelligence mission demands a diverse workforce and a culture of inclusivity, collaboration, and respect.

While there has been steady progress in improving the representation of minorities, women, and PWD across the DIE, there is still more to be done to bring the DIE in-line with the broader Federal workforce and to better reflect the demographics of our country. We recognize that the military intelligence components, in particular, have challenges in recruitment, promotion, and retention that demand our attention, engagement, and solutions.

We have looked at private sector diversity programs and a key feature they all have in common is leadership, accountability, and awareness. Our leadership is committed, and I am committed. The USD(I) has made recruiting, training, and sustaining a modern, diverse workforce a guiding principle for our organization and the Defense Intelligence Enterprise. We look forward to working in partnership with you to improve the diversity of our current workforce and to make lasting change for the generations behind us.