

Congressional Testimony

Meeting the Challenge of White Nationalist Terrorism at Home and Abroad

Sharon Nazarian, Ph.D.
Senior Vice President for International Affairs
ADL (Anti-Defamation League)

Joint Hearing

House Committee on Foreign Affairs
Subcommittee on the Middle East,
North Africa, and International Terrorism,
&
House Committee on Homeland Security
Subcommittee on Intelligence and Counterterrorism

Washington, D.C.
September 18, 2019
2:00 pm



*Working to stop the defamation of the
Jewish people and to secure justice and
fair treatment to all since 1913*

Introduction

Since 1913, the mission of ADL (the Anti-Defamation League) has been to “stop the defamation of the Jewish people and to secure justice and fair treatment to all.” For decades, ADL has fought against anti-Semitism and bigotry by exposing extremist groups and individuals who spread hate and incite violence. Today, ADL is the foremost non-governmental authority on anti-Semitism, domestic terrorism, extremism, hate groups, and hate crimes. Through our Center on Extremism (COE), whose experts monitor a variety of extremist and terrorist movements, ADL plays a leading role in exposing extremist movements and activities, while helping communities and government agencies alike in combating them. ADL’s team of experts – analysts, investigators, researchers, and linguists – use cutting-edge technologies and investigative techniques to track and disrupt extremists and extremist movements worldwide.

I have personal experience in understanding the fear and isolation that extremists can inflict on those whom they target and demonize. When I was a child, I fled with my parents and siblings and extended family from the bigoted tyranny of Khomeini’s regime in Iran. My family had lived and thrived in Iran for generations. We were citizens of the country, belonged to a community, institutions and businesses, until it was made clear that a new regime holding extremist and bigoted values and prejudices felt we had no place there. Today, the Jewish community of Iran is near extinction after a 2500 year rich history because all Jews know that there is no future in Iran for their children.

I am here today to speak to you about the internationalization and increasing interconnectedness of white supremacist ideology around the world which aims to dehumanize, threaten, and eradicate whole communities and the dangers of such ideology becoming ever more pernicious and violent with the aid of technology and the current environment of divisiveness and the demonization of the “other.”

As recently as several weeks ago, people with personal connections to me were targeted, yet again. A man in Nevada was arrested last month “after investigators uncovered his plot to attack an LGBTQ nightclub, a local synagogue and the regional ADL office with firearms and explosives”.¹ He had reportedly exchanged messages with members of organized violent white supremacist groups, including Feuerkrieg Division, an offshoot of Atomwaffen, a group that has allegedly been linked to as many as five murders in the United States.²

¹ Anti-Defamation League, “Man Arrested for Bomb Plot Listed Synagogue, LGBTQ Bar, and ADL as Potential Targets,” *ADL Blog*, August 16, 2019. (<https://www.adl.org/blog/man-arrested-for-bomb-plot-listed-synagogue-lgbtq-bar-and-adl-as-potential-targets>)

² Gabriella Benavidez and Tiana Bohner, “Court Documents Lay Out Las Vegas Man’s Terror Plot, Targets,” *Fox5 Vegas*, August 10, 2019. (https://www.fox5vegas.com/news/local/court-documents-lay-out-las-vegas-man-s-terror-plot/article_a2e150fe-bb03-11e9-8e30-2b97402c2afe.html); Eileen Hershenov “On Hate Crimes and White

Calling the Threat by Its Name

On October 27, 2018, America witnessed the deadliest attack on Jews in its history when Robert Bowers allegedly stormed a Pittsburgh synagogue armed with an assault rifle and three handguns, shouting “All Jews must die,” and killed 11 people in their place of worship.³ Less than five months later, Brenton Tarrant allegedly perpetrated the deadliest attack against Muslims in New Zealand’s history, slaughtering 51 people who had gathered for prayer at two mosques.⁴ On April 27, 2019, alleged assailant John Earnest opened fire in a synagogue in Poway, California, killing one congregant and wounding several others. On August 3, 2019, Patrick Crusius allegedly targeted Mexicans when he opened fire at a Walmart in El Paso, Texas, killing 22 people and wounding more than two dozen. These were not the first tragedies at the hands of white supremacist terrorists, and, unfortunately, they will not be the last.

White supremacy is a transnational terrorist threat that has already begun to engulf us all. For the past two decades, law enforcement officials worldwide have been focused primarily on the Islamist extremist threat. They have pursued terror organizations like Al Qaeda or ISIS who regularly make bold pronouncements about establishing a global caliphate and whose followers have murdered thousands, the vast majority in the Muslim world. And it’s fair to say that certain governments in the Middle East have aided and abetted the rise of this threat.

The threat of home-grown terrorism inspired by Islamist extremist propaganda remains clear and present. In recent years, however, we have seen an increase in other types of violent extremism, and our government has failed to take sufficient measures to also address this rising threat. Simply, white nationalism is a threat of growing lethality with similar global ambitions and a murderous strategy to achieve those ends.

ADL has been tracking the resurgence of white supremacy off and online and we have been working to identify how to more effectively address this growing threat.

International White Supremacy

While we have seen a surge in domestic white supremacy, we are witnessing this phenomenon happening on an international level, as well. Further, the growing global interconnectedness of this phenomenon has been fueling its expansion, acceleration, and increasing casualty toll. White

Supremacy,” *Testimony before the House Committee on the Judiciary*, April 9, 2019.

(<https://www.adl.org/media/12760/download>)

³ Jay Croft and Saeed Ahmed, “The Pittsburgh synagogue shooting is believed to be the deadliest attack on Jews in American history, the ADL says,” *CNN*, October 28, 2018. (<https://www.cnn.com/2018/10/27/us/jewish-hate-crimes-fbi/index.html?no-st=1568236698>)

⁴ Anti-Defamation League, “White Supremacist Terrorist Attack at Mosques in New Zealand,” *ADL Blog*, March 15, 2019. (<https://www.adl.org/blog/white-supremacist-terrorist-attack-at-mosques-in-new-zealand>)

supremacists around the world are meeting online and in person at conferences, capitalizing on the digitization of information, which has in turn accelerated the international exchange of ideas. These virtual and actual gatherings provide key opportunities for white supremacists to share ideas and tactics and recruit a new generation of followers.

Although some white supremacists in the U.S. are influenced by the written works of European white supremacists and far-right writers, today more than ever, in-person conferences, rallies, forums and events build and solidify their relationships. The speakers at these events tend to share a common focus: they are concerned about changing demographics in the U.S. and Europe, the immigration of non-white people, the preservation and celebration of “white identity” and the effects of globalism and multiculturalism. Some speakers may focus on their individual countries, but there is a joint purpose of preserving what they term “white European culture.” They see themselves as a united force working together to both halt demographic changes and to convince disaffected whites to join their cause.

Over the past decade, we have seen surging violence in the United States and Europe motivated by right-wing extremism. The perpetrators are connected by an extremist ideology that continues to gain international followers.

In 2011, Anders Breivik killed 77 people in Norway, after leaving a hate-filled manifesto railing against immigrants and Muslims. Four years later in the U.S., white supremacist Dylann Roof killed nine black parishioners in South Carolina in 2015. Both Breivik and Roof influenced Brenton Tarrant. Tarrant mentioned both men in his manifesto, titled “The Great Replacement,” named after the white supremacist theory that whites are being replaced by non-whites. Tarrant, in turn, influenced John Earnest, who cited Tarrant as an inspiration in the statement he allegedly posted before carrying out his violent act. Patrick Crusius also allegedly cited Tarrant’s “The Great Replacement” in his own manifesto. One week later, a Norwegian gunman, Philip Manshaus, who had referenced “Saint Tarrant” on a message board, was overpowered as he attempted to shoot people at a mosque in Oslo.

Even as violent white supremacists grab headlines, there are influential ideologues operating behind the scenes to spread hateful white supremacist rhetoric and ideas to eager audiences around the world. While some of them may take an academic approach to what they perceive as a danger to “white civilization,” their words can impel violence in those who believe that only violent interventions will save what they term “white European culture.” For example, Renaud Camus, the French author of a book entitled *The Great Replacement*, does not condone violence, but his words influenced Tarrant and Crusius.

Ties between American and European White Supremacists

Below is a summary of the ties between American and European white supremacists in select countries. This information is the result of collaboration between researchers at ADL's Center on

Extremism and European colleagues at the Amadeu Antonio Foundation (Germany), Community Security Trust (UK), Expo Foundation (Sweden), Observatoire des Radicalités Politiques, Fondation Jean Jaurès, (France) and Never Again Association (Poland).

United Kingdom

There is a long history of interaction between white supremacists in the UK and the United States. In 1962, the “Cotswold Declaration” between British neo-Nazi Colin Jordan, founder of the National Socialist Movement (later called the British Movement), and American Nazi Party founder George Lincoln Rockwell created an international umbrella group of National Socialist organizations.

The Turner Diaries, a 1978 racist novel that depicts a world takeover by an all-white army and its systematic extermination of Blacks, Jews and “race traitors,” written by the late neo-Nazi William Pierce, continues to have a major influence on white supremacists around the world.

In the early 1990s, *The Turner Diaries* impacted the formation and tactics of Combat 18, a British neo-Nazi terrorist organization that wanted to mirror the events in the novel by starting a race war in the service of building an Aryan homeland, themes prevalent in the book. According to writer Nick Lowles’ book, *White Riot: The Story of Combat 18*, *The Turner Diaries* was also a favorite of neo-Nazi David Copeland, who in 1999 detonated nail bombs targeting minority and LGBT communities in London, killing three people and wounding many others. In addition, both Combat 18 and Copeland had ties to the British National Party (BNP), a neo-Nazi party in the UK with which Pierce interacted.⁵

Pierce addressed a BNP meeting in London in 1997.⁶ A May 1999 article in the British newspaper *The Sunday Herald* mentioned that Stephen Cartwright, a former Combat 18 member and a BNP member, met with Pierce in the U.S. that year. In an interview with the paper, Cartwright said, “The BNP has learned tactics, raised its profile and fundraising powers in America, and been able to take away the thinking of men like Dr. Pierce.”⁷

In a May 1995 NPR broadcast, reporter Sylvia Poggioli quoted researcher and far-right expert Tony Robson as saying, “Combat 18 follows the ideas of two other Americans; William Pierce, author of *The Turner Diaries* and Louie Beam, the theoretician of a strategy known as 'leaderless

⁵ Nick Martin, “The Rise of the Invisible Extremist,” Sunday Express, July 2, 2000, page 34. (<https://www.ukpressonline.co.uk/ukpressonline/explore/EG/SExp/2000-07-02/final/page34>)

⁶ *Explosion of Hate: The Growing Danger of the National Alliance*, Anti-Defamation League, 1998, page 18.

⁷ Neil Mackay, “The Hate Machine,” *The Sunday Herald*, July 2, 2000.

resistance.' Combat 18's bulletin outlines the strategy, the creation of thousands of small, autonomous cells, with not more than four members each in order to avoid infiltration.”⁸

More recently, the London Forum, a far-right discussion group run by Jeremy Bedford-Turner, who was jailed for one year for inciting racial hatred, has spawned U.S. equivalents.⁹ American white supremacist Greg Johnson, who has spoken at The Forum's meetings, was sufficiently impressed by the London Forum that he created the New York Forum, the Northwest Forum and the Atlanta Forum.¹⁰

In addition, Atomwaffen Division, a violent U.S.-based neo-Nazi group tied to five murders, inspired the formation of a British offshoot called Sonnenkrieg Division. Members of Atomwaffen and British neo-Nazis who formed Sonnenkrieg Division communicated online and also planned to meet in person. Three members of Sonnenkrieg Division were arrested by British authorities in December 2018 and two were subsequently jailed for terror offenses, including advocating for “race traitors” to be killed.

Germany

Germany has a long-standing tradition of exchange with American far-right extremists. Adolf Hitler, the Nazi Party and National Socialism encouraged the founding of groups with a similar ideology in the U.S. before the Second World War, such as the pro-Nazi German American Bund. Other such groups were formed after the war and the Holocaust, such as the American Nazi Party. In the 1990s, the neo-Nazi National Alliance (at the time the largest neo-Nazi group in the U.S.) had ties to Germany's National Democratic Party and its chairman, Udo Voigt. Voigt even gave an interview to *National Vanguard*, the Alliance publication, in 1996.

The Alliance is not the only American white supremacist group with ties to Germany. Gary Lauck, an American neo-Nazi based in Lincoln, Nebraska, runs a website known by its German name, *Nationalsozialistische Deutsche Arbeiterpartei—Auslandsorganisation* (National Socialist German Workers Party—Overlands Organization, or more simply, NSDAP-AO). For years, Lauck distributed Nazi propaganda in Germany, an illegal activity that landed him in a German prison in the 1990s.

As in Great Britain, both William Pierce's book *The Turner Diaries* and Louis Beam's concept of “leaderless resistance” had an important influence on the formation of German *Freie*

⁸ Liane Hansen, “Interview with Tony Robson, Researcher, Spotlight Magazine,” *NPR Weekend Edition Sunday*, May 28, 1995.

⁹ Lizzie Deardon, “Former British soldier jailed for antisemitic speech where he incited supporters to ‘free England from Jewish control,’” *The Independent*, May 15, 2018. (<https://www.independent.co.uk/news/uk/crime/jeremy-bedford-turner-race-hate-speech-antimsemitism-british-soldier-england-jewish-control-a8352561.html>)

¹⁰ Greg Johnson, “The Second Meeting of the Northwest Forum,” *Counter Currents Publishing*, February 27, 2017. (<https://www.counter-currents.com/2017/02/the-second-meeting-of-the-northwest-forum/>)

Kameradschaften (free/independent comradeships) and German far-right terrorism in the 1990s. Pierce's book was read and discussed among these German groups. These groups were interested in newer material on race war and rebuilding a "pure, Aryan" Germany, but the country's laws made the production and publication of explicit neo-Nazi material difficult.

Some groups were also inspired by Beam. For example, the German terrorist organization National Socialist Underground (NSU) originated out of the comradeship Thuringian Homeland Protection (Thüringer Heimatschutz) following the concept of Beam's leaderless resistance. Authorities also believe that the NSU was inspired by the race war depicted in *The Turner Diaries*.¹¹ The NSU killed 10 people in Germany (nine of them immigrants) and carried out bombings, robberies and attempted murders between 2000 and 2007.¹²

In addition, since the 2000s, German and American white supremacists (i.e. David Duke) have participated and spoken at one another's conferences and events.¹³ German far-right online activists are also inspired by the American "alt right" and try to copy their ideas, memes and trolling strategies. Analogous to online activity around the 2016 U.S. presidential election, a network of new and old German far-right activists tried to copy the strategies of "memetic warfare" by organizing on Discord servers, a chat and messaging platform, fighting people who are pejoratively described as social justice warriors and promoting the far-right party Alternative for Germany using memes.¹⁴

Sweden

Cooperation between right-wing extremists in Sweden and their counterparts in the U.S. has been ongoing for many years. The Swedish white power music scene played a leading role in this collaboration. In 1997, the U.S. band Max Resist played in Sweden and was arrested, alongside more than 300 Nazi supporters who attended the concert, after Max Resist began to perform Nazi salutes on stage.¹⁵

Nordiska Festivalen (The Nordic Festival), organized by Nordiska Förbundet, (the Nordic League) can be seen as a precursor to the white supremacist conferences that have taken place in

¹¹ Frank Zeller, "Beate Zschaepe, woman in the dock in neo-Nazi terror trial," *Agence France Presse English*, July 10, 2018. (<https://www.france24.com/en/20180710-beate-zschaepe-woman-dock-neo-nazi-terror-trial>)

¹² Philip Oltermann, "German Neo-Nazi Beate Zschape Gets Life for NSU Murders," *The Guardian*, July 11, 2018. (<https://www.theguardian.com/world/2018/jul/11/german-neo-nazi-beate-zschape-gets-life-for-nsu-murders>)

¹³ Thomas Grumke, "Die transnationale Infrastruktur der extremistischen Rechten," in *Globalisierter Rechtsextremismus? Die extremistische Rechte in der Ära der Globalisierung*, ed. Thomas Greven and Thomas Grumke (Wiesbaden: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften, 2006).

¹⁴ Kira Ayyadi, "Wie 'Reconquista Germanica' Auf Discord Seine 'Troll-Armee' Organisiert," *Bell Tower News*, February 15, 2018. (<https://www.belltower.news/wie-reconquista-germanica-auf-discord-seine-troll-armee-organisiert-47020/>)

¹⁵ Expo, "Brottby - Dubbelt bakslag för vit makt-musik," *Expo*, April 16, 2003. (<https://expo.se/arkivet/2003/04/brottby-dubbelt-bakslag-f%C3%B6r-vit-makt-musik>)

Sweden over the last decade. The events featured far-right authors published by Nordiska Förlaget (Nordic Press), including David Duke.¹⁶

In 2007, “Free The Order Sweden” was formed to support members of American white supremacist terrorist group The Order.¹⁷ In 2009, the Swedish group published a book including interviews with members of The Order.¹⁸ Another American white supremacist group, the Hammerskins, have had a small Swedish branch since 2009.¹⁹

Also in Sweden, the now-defunct publishing house run by neo-Nazi Party of the Swedes (Svenskarnas Parti), published Swedish translations of *The Turner Diaries* and *Understanding Jewish Influence* by Kevin MacDonald, an influential, retired anti-Semitic professor based in California.²⁰ When the organization started their podcast Radio Framåt (Radio Forward) in 2012, they drew inspiration from James Edwards, a white supremacist who runs an online radio show, “The Political Cesspool,” based in Tennessee. Edwards appeared on Radio Framåt to discuss racial issues and “white people’s future prospects” in February 2015. The host of the show said, “It was really great to talk to James, especially because he and his radio program - and it is a real radio program which is broadcasted through the radio waves not like us who are a simple podcast... has been something of a role model to us, the format, the thoughts around it and how we want to present it.”²¹

Today, far-right and white supremacist figures in Sweden sponsor international conferences such as the Scandza Forum, which feature white supremacists from the United States as speakers. Arktos Media, run by Daniel Friberg, a Swedish white supremacist, has many ties to American counterparts. He hired American editors at Arktos and also attempted to create a joint Swedish/American media company focusing on the alt right in 2017, with American white supremacists Richard Spencer and Jason Jorjani. In addition, the white supremacist group Identity Evropa (re-branded in 2019 as American Identity Movement) has also advertised Arktos in their campus propaganda.

France

¹⁶ Expo, “Nordiska förbundet,” *Expo*, November 2, 2018 (<https://expo.se/fakta/wiki/nordiska-forbundet>)

¹⁷ See Internet Archives Wayback Machine, “Free the Order Sverige,” archived August 20, 2007. (<https://web.archive.org/web/20070820103621/http://www.freetheorder.se/>)

¹⁸ Alex Bengtsson and Daniel Vergara, “Nyvald partiledare hyllade terrorister,” *Expo*, January 14, 2013. (<https://expo.se/2013/01/nyvald-partiledare-hyllade-terrorister>)

¹⁹ See Internet Archives Wayback Machine, “Swedish HammerSkins,” archived September 23, 2018. (<https://web.archive.org/web/20180923005053/http://www.hammerskins.net/svhs/index.html>)

²⁰ Kevin MacDonald, *Att förstå det judiska inflytandet*, Logic Publishing Sweden, 2014. (<https://logik.se/Produkt/att-forsta-det-judiska-inflytandet/>)

²¹ See Internet Archives Wayback Machine, “Med James Edwards,” archived June 29, 2015. (<https://web.archive.org/web/20150629092851/https://www.motgift.nu/2014/02/veckans-motgift-1-med-james-edwards/>)

There are also many ties between far-right figures in France and the U.S. Jared Taylor, president and editor of *American Renaissance*, a white supremacist online publication that holds annual conferences, has longstanding ties to the French far right. His first encounter with them was through Group for Research and Study of European Civilization (GRECE), a think tank founded in Nice in January 1969. Taylor has invited French far-right thinkers and politicians to numerous conferences in the U.S.

Kevin McDonald, an American white supremacist and retired professor, has been translated into French and published by a publishing house, Editions Pierre Marteau, which has also published *The Turner Diaries*. The weekly *Rivarol*, a far-right publication that has been around since 1951 and is available at most newsstands, has published an interview with MacDonald and has also featured articles about him, citing MacDonald as one of the foremost authorities on the white nationalist movement in the U.S.²² The publication has also interviewed former U.S. Klan leader David Duke.²³

A writer using the pseudonym "Guillaume Durocher" is the most active bridge between the U.S. and French extreme right "scenes." He appears to be an American living in France, and is associated with several American white supremacist publications, including *Occidental Observer*, *The Occidental Quarterly* and *Counter-Currents*. He also writes for *The Unz Review*, a California-based online publication that features anti-Semites and white supremacists, and *Arktos*.²⁴

The rise of the alt right in America has given new prominence to the ideas of the French New Right, a school of thought born in the 1970s with the goal of ideologically influencing the mainstream conservative right on topics including race relations, ethnicity, and the pagan roots of European culture and bioethics. The New Right has had an influence on a number of American white supremacists, including Jared Taylor and Richard Spencer. Both Taylor and Spencer have spoken about the impact of the works of New Right thinkers such as Alain de Benoist and Guillaume Faye on their own ideology and invited these men to their own conferences in the U.S.

Poland

²² Baillet in the March 2013 issue of *Rivarol*'s sister publication, the monthly *Ecrits de Paris*. The reference is: Philippe BAILLET: "Kevin Macdonald ou la question juive sans concession ni passion." McDonald gave an interview to *Rivarol* in 2010 (between January and March. He is also often quoted in *Rivarol* as one of the foremost authorities in the US White Supremacist movement (for ex: *Rivarol*, 28 February 2008, p.12)

²³ *Rivarol*, January 2010.

²⁴ Anti-Defamation League, "California Entrepreneur Ron Unz Launches a Series of Rhetorical Attacks on Jews," *ADL Blog*, October 4, 2018. (<https://www.adl.org/blog/california-entrepreneur-ron-unz-launches-a-series-of-rhetorical-attacks-on-jews>)

Connections between the Polish and U.S. right-wing extremists go back at least to the mid-1990s, when the Polish radical nationalist party National Rebirth of Poland (Narodowe Odrodzenie Polski, NOP) became strongly influenced by Western neo-Nazi groups and ideas. For example, NOP's magazine *Szczerbiec* (The Royal Sword) was clearly influenced by William Pierce's neo-Nazi group National Alliance. Pierce's articles were published in Polish translation in the late 1990s and early 2000s. NOP activists also published and promoted the Polish editions of Pierce's violent novels (*The Turner Diaries* and *Hunter*).

In the 2010s, the NOP focused on David Duke. The pro-NOP website nacionalista.pl has frequently covered Duke's activities and ideology and promoted Duke's bigoted book *Jewish Supremacism*, which was published by the Polish offshoot of the Creativity Movement in 2013. In November 2011, Duke addressed (through a video link) the participants of the NOP's annual gathering in Wrocław, marking Poland's Independence Day.

A current Member of the Polish Parliament, Robert Majka, extolled Duke's ideas in an interview posted in April 2019 on the far-right YouTube channel CEP Powisle. The bulk of the conversation, which lasted more than 40 minutes, was devoted to Majka's enthusiastic praise for Duke and the ideology Duke promotes on the pages of *Jewish Supremacism*.²⁵

Kevin MacDonald has found popularity in Poland beyond the extreme-right milieu. His book *The Culture of Critique* was published by mainstream Polish academic publisher Aletheia and distributed through mainstream distribution channels. In the last few years, the book has frequently been promoted in Polish cities via stickers and leaflets distributed at far-right nationalist events, apparently by anonymous MacDonald fans.

The annual Polish Independence Day March in Warsaw on November 11 and its accompanying events have become a major international "meeting hub," a key element in the ongoing internationalization of nationalism that attracts white supremacists from all over Europe. At the November 2017 march, large banners were displayed with slogans such as: "Europe will be white or it will be deserted," and "White Europe of brotherly nations." The organizers' official platform bore the MW banner with the slogan "All Different, All White" (a mockery of the Council of Europe's campaign "All Different All Equal"). The MW's spokesman, Mateusz Pławski, declared "racial separatism" to be the doctrine of the march co-organizers in an interview with *Do Rzeczy* weekly on the day after the event.²⁶

²⁵ CEPowisle, "Poseł Robert Majka: Nadchodząca Supremacja żydowska - to oznacza Twoje życie za miskę ryżu dziennie," *YouTube*, April 1, 2019. (<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Zlhs3-wdYis>)

²⁶ Jakub Oworuszco, "Mateusz Pławski z Młodzieży Wszechpolskiej o 'separatyzmie rasowym'. Siemoniak: Fatalna wypowiedź," *Polska Times*, November 13, 2017. (<https://polskatimes.pl/mateusz-plawski-z-mlodziezy-wszechpolskiej-o-separatyzmie-rasowym-siemoniak-fatalna-wypowiedz/ar/12668376>)

That year, Richard Spencer planned to attend Poland's Independence Day March and its accompanying panel event "Europe of the Future: A Vision after the Collapse of the West," alongside Daniel Friberg and Olena Semenyaka (a representative of Azov, the Ukrainian far-right group and militia). However, Polish authorities prevented Spencer from coming to Poland, with one official citing Spencer's views of the Holocaust as the reason he would be unwelcome in the country.

In 2018 and 2019, a trans-Atlantic movement directed against alleged "Jewish claims against Poland" gained momentum, drawing from and spreading disinformation and conspiracy theories rooted in anti-Semitic stereotypes among Polish communities. The movement culminated in a large demonstration that took place in front of the U.S. Embassy in Warsaw during the European Parliament electoral campaign on May 11, 2019. The march was organized by a newly formed electoral coalition of far-right groups such as the RN, known as "Konfederacja" (Confederation). The group is strongly opposed to the European Union and its name choice was a nod to the anti-Union Confederation of the American Civil War period. Confederate flags were spotted at the embassy protest.

Ukraine

A number of American white supremacists also have connections to Azov, a Ukrainian extremist group and militia. The Azov Battalion was created in May 2014 to fight Russian-backed separatists in the east of the country. Many of the volunteers who joined the group had ties to the far-right hooligan movement in Eastern Europe.²⁷ The group also has ties to neo-Nazis in Ukraine.

Investigative reports on Azov from *Bellingcat* and Radio Free Europe Radio Liberty point to the many ways Azov has reached out to like-minded American extremists. Azov reportedly has connections to the U.S.-based white supremacist group Rise Above Movement, whose members traveled in 2018 on a European tour to include a visit to Ukraine to meet key figures of the Azov movement.

Bellingcat also reported on recent contacts between former members of the U.S. armed services and the National Corps, the political wing of Azov, which was allegedly trying to recruit internationally in order to "defend the white race."²⁸ A recruiter from Azov reportedly appeared on the American white supremacist "Radio Wehrwolf" where he said that the National Corps

²⁷ Christopher Miller, "Azov, Ukraine's Most Prominent Ultranationalist Group, Sets Its Sights On U.S., Europe," *Radio Free Europe*, November 14, 2018. (<https://www.rferl.org/a/azov-ukraine-s-most-prominent-ultranationalist-group-sets-its-sights-on-u-s-europe/29600564.html>)

²⁸ Oleksiy Kuzmenko, "Defend the White Race": American Extremists Being Co-Opted by Ukraine's Far-Right," *Bellingcat*, February 15, 2019. (<https://www.bellingcat.com/news/uk-and-europe/2019/02/15/defend-the-white-race-american-extremists-being-co-opted-by-ukraines-far-right/>)

wanted to help teach combat skills to Americans who wanted to join Ukraine in their fight against Russia.²⁹

The internationalization of white supremacy is strengthening a hateful and dangerous ideology. European and American adherents are learning from each other, supporting each other and reaching new audiences. They feel empowered and emboldened because they perceive that they are influencing the political climate and reaching disaffected whites.

Russia

Russian state support for far-right political parties in Europe has been documented since 2014.³⁰ More recently, research by the Hungarian think-tank, Political Capital, has shown Russian state support for extremist groups in Central and Eastern Europe.³¹ The extremist groups take actions to incite ethnic strife with the goal of destabilizing these countries, including by promoting irredentism. The paramilitary groups associated with the extremists have also gone to eastern Ukraine to fight alongside the pro-Russian secessionists.

Russian and American extremists have also made personal connections and engaged in ideological outreach. The main protagonist on the Russian side is Alexander Dugin, a far-right, ultra-nationalist, ultra-conservative Russian philosopher and political scientist who is the founder of the “Eurasian movement,” which theorizes that Russia, with the help of former Soviet bloc countries and Central European nations, will challenge the hegemony of the United States. Dugin has reportedly influenced Russian leader Vladimir Putin and Putin’s inner circle.³² He is known for his focus on fascism, traditionalism and his anti-Western, anti-liberal and totalitarian ideas. Dugin has founded a number of nationalist parties in Russia, including the National Bolshevik Party and the Eurasia Party.³³ He has ties to a number of white supremacists in the U. S., and has written articles for Altright.com., the now-defunct site headed by white supremacist Richard Spencer, as well as Red Ice, a white supremacist media outfit. Spencer’s ex-wife has translated Dugin’s work into English.

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ Political Capital Institute, “The Russian Connection,” *Political Capital Institute*, March 14, 2014. (http://pdc.ceu.hu/archive/00007035/01/PC_Russian-Connection_2014.pdf)

³¹ Péter Krekó, Lóránt Győri, and Edit Zgut, “From Russia With Hate,” *Political Capital Institute*, April 2017. (https://www.politicalcapital.hu/pc-admin/source/documents/PC_NED_summary_analysis_EN_20170428.pdf)

³² Paul Knott, “Meet the most dangerous man in the world,” *The New European*, September 21, 2018. (<https://www.theneweuropean.co.uk/top-stories/most-dangerous-man-world-paul-knott-putin-fascist-philosopher-1-5703698>)

³³ Robert Zurgin, “Dugin’s Evil Theology,” *National Review*, June 18, 2014. (<https://www.nationalreview.com/2014/06/dugins-evil-theology-robert-zubrin/>); “Putin’s Long Game? Meet the Eurasian Union,” *The Boston Globe*, March 9, 2014. (<https://www.bostonglobe.com/ideas/2014/03/09/putin-long-game-meet-eurasian-union/1eKlXEC3TJfzqK54eIX5fL/story.html>)

In 2014, Spencer invited Dugin to attend his National Policy Institute conference in Budapest, but Dugin was reportedly warned that he would not be allowed to enter Hungary³⁴ and the conference was later cancelled by Hungarian authorities. In 2015, to mark the launch of the now-defunct neo-Nazi Traditionalist Worker Party, led by Matthew Heimbach,³⁵ Dugin recorded a speech titled "To My American Friends in Our Common Struggle." That same year, Preston Wigginton, a Texas-based neo-Nazi, held an event at Texas A&M, where Dugin appeared via the Internet as a speaker. Dugin has also appeared on InfoWars with Alex Jones, a rabid conspiracy theorist who has argued that the Sandy Hook mass shooting was a hoax.³⁶ Dugin and Jones have also appeared on Russian TV together, and in 2018, alt right figures Brittany Pettibone and Lauren Southern interviewed Dugin.³⁷

In 2015, American white supremacists Jared Taylor and Sam Dickson addressed the International Russian Conservative Forum in St. Petersburg. The event featured Russian nationalists and representatives from extreme-right parties in Europe.³⁸

Beyond Europe

Australia

The alleged perpetrator of the Christchurch attack was an Australian man who was influenced by white supremacist figures and websites from around the world. According to the most recent anti-Semitism report by the Executive Council of Australian Jewry, between September 2017-September 2018, 366 anti-Semitic incidents were recorded. One neo-Nazi group, Antipodean Resistance, was reportedly responsible for 133 (36%) of the year's total incidents.³⁹

Canada

There is extensive engagement between American and Canadian white supremacist organizations and individuals. For example, as ADL's new report documents, Canadian white supremacist leaders influence and engage extensively with like-minded individuals and groups

³⁴ Nick Thorpe, "Far right holds secret congress in Hungary," *BBC News*, October 7, 2015. (<https://www.bbc.com/news/world-europe-29503378>)

³⁵ Tom Porter "Charlottesville's Alt-Right Leaders Have a Passion for Vladimir Putin," *Newsweek*, August 16, 2017. (<https://www.newsweek.com/leaders-charlottesvilles-alt-right-protest-all-have-ties-russian-fascist-651384>)

³⁶ Justin Salhani, "Trump, white nationalism's favorite thinker, and America's premier crackpot make strange bedfellows," *ThinkProgress*, December 22, 2016. (<https://thinkprogress.org/trump-white-nationalisms-favorite-thinker-and-america-s-premier-crackpot-make-strange-bedfellows-7e57c0b7e6be/>)

³⁷ Brittany Pettibone, "Meeting Aleksandr Dugin," *YouTube*, June 8, 2018. (https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=1kbWxA2D_9M)

³⁸ Anti-Defamation League, "American White Supremacists Attend Russian Nationalist Conference," *ADL Blog*, March 26, 2015. (<https://www.adl.org/blog/american-white-supremacists-attend-russian-nationalist-conference>)

³⁹ European Council of Australian Jewry, *The ECAJ 2018 Antisemitism Report*, November 25, 2018. (<http://www.ecaj.org.au/2018/the-ecaj-2018-antisemitism-report/>)

around the globe. Examples of such figures include Paul Fromm, Faith Goldy (a.k.a. Faith Goldy-Bazos), and Stefan Molyneux, among others.

South Africa

White supremacists in America and elsewhere have frequently pushed an inaccurate narrative claiming that white farmers in South Africa are the targets of a large-scale, state-sanctioned, and racially-motivated campaign of killings by South Africa's black majority.⁴⁰ Anders Breivik made numerous references to this supposed trend in his manifesto, and Dylann Roof wore the flag of apartheid-era South Africa on a jacket.⁴¹ Some South African extremists have blamed the failure of the media to cover these attacks on their conspiratorial assertion that the media was "controlled by the Jews."⁴²

Brazil and Argentina

After World War II, some countries in Latin America witnessed significant immigration of Nazi officers and as a result, pro-Hitler propaganda has remained ingrained among certain segments of society to this day. Argentina and Brazil are the two main countries in Latin America where neo-Nazi and white supremacist activity is particularly notable.

In the past decade, the number of white supremacist websites in these areas grew from less than a couple of thousand to close to 12,000 sites. Similarly, white supremacist posts on the top five online social forums increased dramatically from a few million posts in the year 2010 to close to 20,000,000 posts in 2019.⁴³

In Argentina, the most worrisome manifestation of white supremacy is the presidential candidacy of the anti-Semite Alejandro Biondini, a neo-Nazi and open admirer of Hitler. In the recent primary elections in August 2019, Biondini received almost 60,000 votes.⁴⁴ Separately, in the city of Mar del Plata, seven people were found guilty of establishing an association to spread their white supremacist views and utilize neo-Nazi symbolism. These individuals were mainly

⁴⁰ ADL, "The Racist Obsession with South African "White Genocide," August 24, 2018. (<https://www.adl.org/blog/the-racist-obsession-with-south-african-white-genocide>)

⁴¹ Background paper by Nechama Brodie.

⁴² Noted in David Saks, "'Sick with Rage' – Petzer's Video Sparks Anti-Semitic Frenzy," *The Citizen (South Africa)*, January 9, 2018. (<https://citizen.co.za/news/opinion/2060024/sick-with-rage-petzers-video-sparks-anti-semitic-frenzy/>)

⁴³ Data collected from Latin America by Dr. Adriana Dias of the UNICAMP University in Campinas, Brazil. "Um mergulho no universo neonazista," *Jornal da Unicamp (Brazil)*, September 28, 2018. (<https://www.unicamp.br/unicamp/ju/noticias/2018/09/28/um-mergulho-no-universo-neonazista>)

⁴⁴ "Argentina neo-Nazi candidate fails to pass primary threshold" *JTA*, August 15, 2019. (<https://www.jta.org/quick-reads/argentine-neo-nazi-political-candidate-fails-to-make-it-to-the-general-election>)

targeting immigrants from Bolivia and the LGBTQ community with intimidation, incitement of hate and violent attacks, as well as anti-Semitic graffiti.⁴⁵

The Resurgence of White Supremacy

Like other forms of extremism, white supremacy is an ideology that its adherents seek to spread. The ADL defines white supremacy as a collection of movements sharing one or more of the following key tenets: 1) white people should have dominance over people of other ethnic and racial backgrounds, especially in places where they may co-exist; 2) white people should live by themselves in a whites-only society; 3) white people have their own "culture" that is superior to other cultures; 4) white people are genetically superior to other people. Most white supremacists believe the white race is in danger of extinction due to a rising "flood" of non-whites, who purportedly are controlled and manipulated by Jews, and that imminent action is needed to "save" the white race. White supremacists typically do not label themselves as such, but instead tend to prefer euphemisms ranging from "white nationalist" to "white separatist" to "race realist" or "identitarian."

Today, the white supremacist movement is not as transparent about its true objectives as it was in the 1980s and early 1990s, when racist skinheads dominated white supremacists' ranks. Today, many white supremacists dress non-descriptly and use coded language. Within the white supremacist community, there is no universal agreement on strategy. Some factions feel the need to adhere to "optics"⁴⁶ and purposefully obfuscate their views in order to infiltrate mainstream politics (an approach decried by Bowers immediately before his alleged attack), whereas others seek "accelerationism," hoping to purposefully spark a race war.

In late 2018, ADL's COE published a comprehensive guide to the current state of white supremacist ideology and groups in the U.S. The report, "New Hate and Old: The Changing Face of White Supremacy in the U.S.,"⁴⁷ provides a detailed look at this dangerous extremist threat. Below is a list of the key findings from that report:

- The white supremacist "Unite the Right" rally in Charlottesville, Virginia, on August 11-12, 2017, attracted some 600 extremists from around the country and ended in deadly violence. These shocking events served as a wake-up call for many Americans about a resurgent white supremacist movement in the United States.

⁴⁵ Jason McNamara, "Neo-Nazis sentenced to jail time for hate crimes in Mar del Plata", Buenos Aires Times, May 4, 2018.

(<https://www.batimes.com.ar/news/argentina/neo-nazis-sentenced-to-jail-time-for-hate-crimes-in-mar-del-plata.phtml>)

⁴⁶ Anti-Defamation League, "Tree of Life Shooting Revives 'Optics' Debate Among White Supremacists," *ADL Blog*, November 6, 2018. (<https://www.adl.org/blog/tree-of-life-shooting-revives-optics-debate-among-white-supremacists>)

⁴⁷ ADL Center for Extremism, *New Hate and Old: The Changing Face of American White Supremacy*, Anti-Defamation League, 2018. (<https://www.adl.org/new-hate-and-old>)

- Modern white supremacist ideology is centered on the assertion that the white race is in danger of extinction, drowned by a rising tide of non-white people who are controlled and manipulated by Jews. White supremacists believe that almost any action is justified if it will help “save” the white race.
- The white supremacist resurgence is driven in large part by the rise of the alt right, the newest segment of the white supremacist movement. Youth-oriented, overwhelmingly male and often tech-savvy, the alt right has provided new energy to the movement, but has also been a destabilizing force, much as racist skinheads were to the movement in the 1980s and early 1990s.
- The alt right has a white supremacist ideology heavily influenced by a number of sources, including paleoconservatism, neo-Nazism and fascism, identitarianism, renegade conservatives and right-wing conspiracy theorists. The alt right also possesses its own distinct subculture, derived especially from the misogynists of the so-called “manosphere” and from online discussion forums such as 4chan, 8chan and Reddit.
- After the 2016 presidential election, the alt right moved from online activism into the real world, forming real-world groups and organizations and engaging in tactics such as targeting college campuses. The alt right also expanded its online propaganda efforts, especially through podcasting.
- As the alt right received increased media scrutiny – in large part due to its own actions, such as the violence at Charlottesville – it experienced dissension and disunity of its own, including the departure of many extremists who did not advocate explicit white supremacy (the so-called “alt lite”). The backlash against the alt right after Charlottesville hurt many of its leading spokespeople but has not resulted, as some have claimed, in a decline in the movement as a whole.
- Other white supremacists—neo-Nazis, traditional white supremacists, racist skinheads, white supremacist religious sects, and white supremacist prison gangs—have also continued their activities. Some white supremacists, such as neo-Nazis, seem to have been buoyed by the alt right to some extent, while others— most notably racist skinheads—may experience a loss of potential recruits at the hands of the alt right.
- Violence and hate crimes represent the most serious problems emanating from the white supremacist movement. White supremacists have killed more people in recent years than any other type of domestic extremist (54% of all domestic extremist-related murders in the past 10 years). They are also a troubling source of domestic terror incidents (including 13 plots or attacks within the past five years).
- Murders and terror plots represent only the tip of the iceberg of white supremacist violence, as there are many more incidents involving less serious crimes, including attempted murders,

assaults, weapons and explosives violations, and more. In addition, white supremacists engage in a lot of other types of crime, including crimes of violence against women and drug-related crimes.

White Supremacist Targets

The groups that are targeted by white supremacists for acts of terrorism sometimes vary by societal context or demography in particular countries. For example, Roma and Sinti are more frequent victims of assaults, murders, and other crimes by white supremacists in European countries than they are inside the United States. Additionally, various white supremacist movements may focus their violence more on some vulnerable minority groups than against others, depending on elements of their ideology or other factors. However, due to the overarching commonalities in ideology among white supremacist groups around the world, there are a number of minority groups that are consistently caught in the crosshairs of white supremacists, both in the United States and around the world, including those targeted on the basis of race, ethnicity, religion, national origin, immigration status, or sexual orientation or gender identity.

Jews

White supremacists have a reservoir of loathing deep enough to accommodate a wide range of hatreds, and they reserve a special status among their enemies for Jews. And although white supremacists fear and despise people of most other races, most also assume whites are far superior to people of other backgrounds, which raises questions about the ability of those ostensibly inferior races truly to threaten white dominance or survival. This, for white supremacists, is where the Jews come in.

White supremacists portray Jews as intelligent, but also as a loathsome, parasitic race of people who control and manipulate the actions of non-white races to the advantage of the Jews and the detriment of the white race. This is the longstanding anti-Semitic notion of the international Jewish conspiracy, a theme no less powerful in the days of the alt right than it was in Tsarist Russia. “Jews are the eternal enemy of the White race,” recently asserted one poster to the white supremacist discussion forum Stormfront, “and need to be treated as such. There are no good Jews, they are all traitors and loyal only to their race...Any action that White people take to get rid of the Jews is strictly self-defense, in much the same way that you would try to destroy a poisonous snake that is threatening your safety. The Jews are poisonous to the moral fabric of White society.” The poster went on to characterize Hitler as too kind and generous in his actions toward the Jews.

Jews, according to white supremacists, are the great puppet-masters. They control the media, they control the Internet, they control everything required to manipulate entire peoples for their benefit. White supremacists typically believe that Jews or Jewish machinations are behind almost

everything they despise or fear, including liberalism, immigration, and multiculturalism. Even psychiatry, as one white supremacist suggested on Twitter in March 2018, “is a Jewish communist weapon, and World Jewry knows the value of using the mental health system as a weapon against people.”

Since 1979, we have compiled an annual Audit of Anti-Semitic Incidents (“the Audit”) throughout the United States, including both criminal and non-criminal acts of harassment and intimidation, including distribution of hate propaganda, threats, and slurs. The data we have compiled from the last three years shows that anti-Semitism in America is far more pervasive than in most previous years. Our recently-released 2018 Audit recorded 1,879 anti-Semitic incidents in the United States. Last year was the third-highest year on record since we began tracking incidents in 1979, it was the deadliest year on record for the U.S. Jewish community, and it saw a doubling of anti-Semitic assaults compared to 2017.

People of African or Caribbean Descent

White supremacists in the United States in particular focus on African-Americans as a racial enemy. Using centuries-old stereotypes and racist attacks portraying African-Americans as unintelligent, primitive and savage, white supremacists claim that black people are the main tools used in Jewish efforts to weaken or attack the white race. “Larceny & mayhem are in the DNA” of blacks, claimed a member of the League of the South on Twitter recently. The dramatically exaggerated issue of “black-on-white crime” is one of the major propaganda tools utilized by white supremacists for recruitment. “You see the crimes against our people every day,” claims the website of the neo-Nazi Vanguard America, referencing people being murdered by “bloodthirsty negroes” and “Judges protecting the rapists of our girls.” The government, claims the neo-Nazi group, does nothing to protect whites, because “the childraping [sic] politicians and their Jewish puppet masters are complicit in these crimes against our race.”

Multi-Racial Couples/Families

White supremacists view multi-racial couples and families as a particularly heinous crime and offense—one that has spurred deadly hate crimes by white supremacists—in part because white supremacists view such couples and families as visual evidence of the future extinction of the white race. White supremacists commonly claim that Jews attempt to harness the “savage lust” white supremacists attribute to most non-white peoples in order to pollute, weaken and eventually end the white race itself. “I think it is impossible to not notice how much the Jew media machine have been pushing White males with Black females,” observed late white supremacist Robert Ransdell on Stormfront last December. He also claimed that the Jews had “pushed” the “Black male with White female” angle for decades. Why would they do this? Another Stormfronter had the clear answer: “They try to teach our children that mud is beautiful. They want to make certain that no more white children are born on this earth.”

Latinos and Immigrants

Latinos—typically perceived by white supremacists as immigrants regardless of how many generations they or their ancestors may have been in the United States—increasingly attract white supremacist attention and hatred. American white supremacists are well aware of demographic changes in the United States, which they typically portray as an “invasion.” “White man,” proclaimed Michael Hill, the League of the South leader, on Twitter in May 2018, “your countries are being purposely overrun with Third World savages who intend to replace you and take your wealth and women. What are you doing to stop this invasion?” This objectionable belief in particular has helped spark a number of different deadly terror attacks by white supremacists.

Muslims

Muslims, and people who are perceived to be Muslims, have increasingly become a target of white supremacists who see Islam as “foreign” and as an existential threat to Western civilization. The fact that many Muslims in the United States are non-white or may be immigrants adds to white supremacist hatred. American white supremacists applaud European far right activists’ efforts to demonize Muslim refugees and immigrants and to portray Europe as being invaded and brought low by Muslim immigration. American white supremacists claim the United States will suffer a similar fate unless Muslims are excluded.

Needless to say, white supremacists also embrace the anti-Muslim conspiracy theories promoted by American Islamophobes. As a result, anti-Muslim themes frequently show up in white supremacist propaganda. In 2017, Vanguard America fliers posted in Texas, Indiana and elsewhere urged readers to “imagine a Muslim-free America,” as did Atomwaffen fliers reported in Pennsylvania. The following year, Identity Evropa members in Dearborn, Michigan, posted fliers reading, “Danger: Sharia City Ahead.” Some white supremacists have even posted fliers at mosques. White supremacists have also taken part in various anti-Muslim protests. When anti-Muslim extremists organized the June 2017 “March Against Sharia” events in cities around the United States, white supremacists rushed to attend, taking part in at least eight such events. Among the white supremacist groups that participated were the Rise Above Movement, Identity Evropa, League of the South, Vanguard America, and Generation Europa.

Other Targets

The list of the people white supremacists hate is virtually never-ending. LGBTQ people, to them, are “Sodomites” and “degenerates” who seek to weaken the white race. “The Sodomites want to take over our community,” proclaimed Arkansas Klan leader Thom Robb on Facebook in June 2018 while organizing a “Rally for Morality.”

White supremacists will occasionally admit to grudging respect for Asian people—typically Chinese or Japanese. This stems from white supremacists’ reliance on studies of IQ tests to try to “prove” supposed white superiority over other races, studies that tend to reveal even higher scores for people of Asian descent. White supremacists also often cite Japan as an example of an ethnostate. Indeed, white supremacists even invited representatives from the right-wing nationalist Japan First Party to a white supremacist conference in Tennessee in June 2018. Makoto Sakurai, the group’s leader, and one other representative showed up; Sakurai, according to the organizers, “gave a candid view of the harm that has routinely accompanied Korean and Chinese immigration in Japan.” That said, white supremacists still tend to reject the idea of Asians living among whites. “They’re still nonwhite,” explained one Stormfronter in February 2018 in a discussion on whether Asian-Americans were allies or enemies, “and therefore they don’t belong in white countries.” Another poster agreed: “If they are Non White [sic] they are an enemy.”

As part of the far right, white supremacists also have a significant degree of political sinistrophobia, or fear and loathing of the left, which they often equate or conflate with Jewish influence.

White Supremacy, Domestic Murders, and Terrorism

White supremacists constitute the oldest domestic terrorists in the United States; the original Ku Klux Klan movement is a prominent example. In the modern era, right-wing extremism constitutes a major domestic terror threat and white supremacists are one of the two major sources of right-wing domestic terrorism in this country (the other main source is antigovernment extremists).

In 2017, ADL published “A Dark and Constant Rage: 25 Years of Right-Wing Terrorism in the United States,”⁴⁸ which identified 150 terrorists plots and attacks attributed to right-wing extremists between 1993 and early 2017. Of these, 64 were connected to white supremacy. Since that report was issued, white supremacists have been involved in at least five additional terrorist plots or attacks. These terrorist incidents have ranged from attempts to use violence to incite a race war to shooting or killing sprees targeting racial and religious minorities for assassination plots. In particular, white supremacist shooting sprees have taken a deadly toll since 2012, raising white supremacist violence to the level of a major terrorist threat in the United States.

Each year, ADL’s COE tracks ideologically-motivated murders perpetrated by all types of extremists.

⁴⁸ ADL Center for Extremism, *A Dark and Constant Rage: 25 Years of Right-Wing Terrorism in the United States*,” Anti-Defamation League, 2017. (<https://www.adl.org/education/resources/reports/dark-constant-rage-25-years-of-right-wing-terrorism-in-united-states>)

In January 2019, COE published its fourth annual report on domestic extremist-related murders, “Murder and Extremism in the United States in 2018,”⁴⁹ providing key insights into the killings, including the motivations behind these violent attacks. Of the 50 murders identified by ADL, white supremacists were responsible for the great majority of those murders, as has been the case in many recent years. In fact, even the one murder attributed to an Islamist extremist was perpetrated by someone who had a past tie to white supremacy. Among this report’s key findings:

- In 2018, domestic extremists killed at least 50 people in the U.S., a sharp increase from the 37 extremist-related murders documented in 2017. The 50 deaths make 2018 the fourth-deadliest year on record for domestic extremist-related killings since 1970.
- The extremist-related murders in 2018 were overwhelmingly linked to right-wing extremists. Every one of the perpetrators had ties to at least one right-wing extremist movement, although one had recently switched to supporting Islamist extremism. White supremacists were responsible for 78% of these murders.
- Looking at extremist murders from a 10-year perspective, right-wing extremists were responsible for 73.3% of the 427 people killed by domestic extremists from 2009-2018 (Islamist extremists were responsible for 23.4% and left-wing extremists for 3.2%). Of the 313 people killed by right-wing extremists during this period, 76% were killed by white supremacists, making white supremacists the most deadly type of extremist movement in the United States over the past 10 years.

White Supremacist Tactics: Propaganda and Events

White supremacist activity has not been limited to murder; they are also targeting more American communities with their hateful propaganda in an attempt to win recruits and intimidate enemies.

ADL’s COE has tracked an ever-growing number of white supremacist propaganda efforts, including the distribution of racist, anti-Semitic and Islamophobic fliers, stickers, banners and posters. The propaganda, which includes everything from veiled white supremacist language to explicitly racist images and words, often features a recruitment element, and is frequently used to physically target buildings and locations associated with minority groups, including Jews, Blacks, Muslims, non-white immigrants and the LGBTQ community.

White supremacists have been actively targeting U.S. college campuses since January 2016, a practice that had failed to gain any real traction until the fall semester of that year. More than

⁴⁹ ADL Center for Extremism, *Murder and Extremism in the United States in 2018*, Anti-Defamation League, 2019. (<https://www.adl.org/murder-and-extremism-2018>)

three years later, these propaganda efforts continue to increase. So far in 2019, the ADL has recorded 230 incidents of white supremacist propaganda on 166 college and university campuses in 38 states and the District of Columbia. The number of incidents already exceed the 219 on campus incidents counted during the full calendar year of 2018. The two most active alt right groups, Identity Evropa (IE), which in early 2019 rebranded itself as the American Identity Movement, or AIM, and Patriot Front, are responsible for the bulk of the campus incidents, with AIM/IE adherents responsible for 145 and Patriot Front members contributing another 59.

In 2018, white supremacists expanded their propaganda distributions to locations beyond colleges and universities and those numbers have continued to accelerate through September 2019. As of September 10, the ADL has documented 1283 off-campus white supremacist propaganda incidents. With more than three months remaining in the calendar year, this number already exceeds last year's full calendar count (868) by 415 incidents.

ADL's H.E.A.T. Map⁵⁰ provides a visual representation of the propaganda distribution efforts and helps highlight specific trends – showing, for example, that the 2019 propaganda incidents are predominantly concentrated in large metropolitan areas, with the highest activity levels in the states of California, Texas, Kentucky, New Jersey, Virginia, Ohio, Florida, Oklahoma and Massachusetts.

White supremacists have also engaged in notable public events, such as the deadly white supremacist rally in Charlottesville or the annual march joined by large numbers of white supremacists in Warsaw on Poland's Independence Day. Incidentally, both of these public events have included guests representing white supremacist groups from numerous other countries.⁵¹ However, since 2017 some white supremacists have also shied away from traditional public events and rallies in favor of “flash” demonstrations – unannounced, quickly disbanded events that allow them to promote their own narratives while limiting the risk of individual exposure, negative media coverage, arrests and public backlash. American Identity Movement and Patriot Front use this method more than any other groups and are responsible for 15 flash demonstrations so far this year.

ADL has examined six small pre-announced white supremacist events in 2019. In March, approximately 15 members of the Shield Wall Network participated in a rally protesting firearm legislation and abortion at the Arkansas State Capitol in Little Rock. The Loyal White Knights held small recruitment rallies (with 12 to 15 participants) in North Carolina (August) and

⁵⁰ ADL Center for Extremism, “ADL H.E.A.T. Map,” Anti-Defamation League, updated June 19, 2019. (<https://www.adl.org/education-and-resources/resource-knowledge-base/adl-heat-map>)

⁵¹ Anti-Defamation League, “Extremist-led March in Poland's Capital Draws 60,000 People,” *ADL Blog*, November 12, 2017. (<https://www.adl.org/blog/extremist-led-march-in-polands-capital-draws-60000-people>); Anti-Defamation League, “Two Years Ago, They Marched in Charlottesville. Where Are They Now?” *ADL Blog*, August 8, 2019. (<https://www.adl.org/blog/two-years-ago-they-marched-in-charlottesville-where-are-they-now>)

Virginia (July). Approximately 9 to 10 members and associates of the Indiana-based Honorable Sacred Knights rallied in Ohio (May) and attempted to hold a public “Kookout” in Indiana (August). In June, 10 members of the neo-Nazi National Socialist Movement protested Detroit’s Motor City Pride Festival.

Even as they engage in fewer and smaller public events, white supremacists continue to enthusiastically attend private events. Hammerfest, an annual hate rock concert and racist skinhead convention, was by far the largest white supremacist event of 2018. The gathering, hosted by the West Coast chapter of the Hammerskin Nation, was also a celebration of the group’s 30th anniversary and brought more than 150 attendees to San Diego, California. Private white supremacist conferences organized by groups such as American Renaissance, League of the South, American Freedom Party, and the Council of Conservative Citizens are also well attended.

Hate Crimes and Other Hate Incidents in America

While most anti-Semitic incidents are not directly perpetrated by extremists or white supremacists, there are important connections between the trends. We found in our annual *Audit of Anti-Semitic Incidents* that in 2018, 249 acts of anti-Semitism (13 percent of the total incidents) were attributable to known extremist groups or individuals inspired by extremist ideology, making it the highest level of anti-Semitic incidents with known connections to extremists or extremist groups since 2004.⁵² Of those, 139 incidents were part of fliering campaigns by white supremacist groups. Another 80 were anti-Semitic robocalls allegedly perpetrated by anti-Semitic podcaster Scott Rhodes in support of the candidacy of Patrick Little, an unabashed white supremacist who ran an unsuccessful campaign for U.S. Senate in California.

The Audit also noted spikes at several points during the year. The final three months of the year were unusually active, with 255 incidents in October, 300 in November and 194 in December. The high number in October included 45 propaganda distributions by white supremacists. The incidents in November and December immediately followed the Pittsburgh massacre, which likely drew more attention to anti-Semitic activities. Incidents first spiked in May, when 209 anti-Semitic acts were reported, including 80 anti-Semitic robocalls sent by white supremacists, which targeted Jewish individuals and institutions with harassing messages.

Hate crimes are a particularly important element of the anti-Semitic incidents that we track. The most recent data about hate crimes made available by the FBI is for 2017.⁵³ The FBI has been tracking and documenting hate crimes reported from federal, state, and local law enforcement officials since 1991 under the Hate Crimes Statistics Act of 1990 (HCSA). Though clearly

⁵² ADL, *2018 Audit of Anti-Semitic Incidents*, April 2019. (<https://www.adl.org/audit2018>)

⁵³ FBI, *2017 Hate Crime Statistics*, November 2018. (<https://ucr.fbi.gov/hate-crime/2017>)

incomplete, the Bureau's annual HCSA reports provide the best single national snapshot of bias-motivated criminal activity in the United States. The Act has also proven to be a powerful mechanism to confront violent bigotry, increasing public awareness of the problem and sparking improvements in the local response of the criminal justice system to hate violence – since in order to effectively report hate crimes, police officials must be trained to identify and respond.

The FBI documented 7,175 hate crimes reported by 16,149 law enforcement agencies across the country – the highest level of participation since the enactment of the HCSA, and a 6 percent increase over 2016 participation of 15,254. Of the 7,175 total incidents:

Hate crimes based on the religion of the victims increased 23 percent, from 1,273 in 2016 to 1,564 in 2017 – the second highest number of religion-based crimes ever (only 2001, after 9/11, recorded more – 1,828).

Crimes directed against Jews increased 37% – from 684 in 2016 to 938 in 2017. Crimes against Jews and Jewish institutions were 60 percent of the total number of reported religion-based crimes and slightly more than 13 percent of all reported hate crimes – far out of proportion with their share of the U.S. population. Every year since 1991, crimes against Jews and Jewish institutions have been between 50 and 80 percent of all religion-based hate crimes.

Race-based crimes were the most numerous (as they have been every year since 1991), totaling 4,131 crimes, almost 58 percent of the total. Crimes against African-Americans, as always, were the plurality of these crimes – 2,013, about 28 percent of all reported hate crimes.

Reported crimes against Muslims decreased 11 percent, from 307 in 2016 to 273 in 2017. However, the 273 anti-Muslim hate crimes recorded was the third most reported crimes against Muslims ever – behind 2016's 307 and 481 in 2001, after the 9/11 terrorist incidents.

Crimes directed against LGBTQ people increased from 1,076 in 2016 to 1,130 in 2017. Crimes directed against individuals on the basis of their gender identity, decreased slightly, from 124 in 2016 to 119 in 2017, slightly less than two percent of all hate crimes.

Importantly, only 2,040 of the 16,149 reporting agencies – less than 13 percent – reported one or more hate crimes to the FBI. That means that about 87 percent of all participating police agencies affirmatively reported zero (0) hate crimes to the FBI (including at least 92 cities over 100,000). And more than 1,000 law enforcement agencies did not report any data to the FBI (including 9 cities over 100,000).

Moreover, we need to remember that these are only reported crimes. Many communities and individuals do not feel comfortable going to law enforcement for a variety of reasons, and so there is likely an undercount of hate crimes resulting from unwillingness to report.

White Supremacists' Exploitation of Social Media- a truly global interconnectivity

Extremist groups are undoubtedly empowered by access to the online world; the internet amplifies the hateful voices of the few to reach millions around the world. The internet also offers community: while most extremists are unaffiliated with organized groups, online forums allow isolated extremists to become more active and involved in virtual campaigns. The internet has increased the global interconnectedness of white supremacist movements, helping to accelerate the movement's deadly impact. As internet proficiency and the use of social media have become universal, so too have the efforts of terrorist and extremist movements to exploit these technologies to increase the accessibility of materials that justify and sanction violence.

Terrorist and extremist movements use online and mobile platforms to spread their messages and to actively recruit adherents who live in the communities they target. Individuals can easily find sanction, support and reinforcement online for their extreme opinions or actions, in some cases neatly packaged alongside bomb-making instructions. This enables adherents like white supremacist mass shooters such as Bowers to self-radicalize without face-to-face contact with an established terrorist group or cell. Extremists and terrorists take full advantage of this virtual audience, regularly publishing detailed instructions for lone wolf terror attacks using knives, as well as cars, trains and other modes of transportation, and in some cases even providing lists of suggested targets. The internet makes it easier than ever for someone to become steeped in extremist ideologies, even to the point of being willing to commit acts of great violence, without ever being involved in an organized extremist group.

Chan Subculture

Perhaps the most important contributor to the subculture of the alt right is the so-called "imageboards," a type of online discussion forum originally created to share images. One of the most important is 4chan, a 15-year-old imageboard whose influence extends far beyond the alt right, as a key source of internet memes. Its "/pol" subforum is a dark place, an anarchic collection of posts that range from relatively innocuous to highly offensive.

Over time, 4chan has become home to many racists and open white supremacists. Some of its imitators, such as 8chan, lean even more towards racism and white supremacy. Parts of Reddit, a popular website that contains a massive collection of subject-oriented discussion threads, also share the chan subculture, as do parts of Tumblr. Sometimes the participants in these threads hail from all over the world, using the internet to spread their hateful efforts and messages.

In April 2019, ADL released a report, a collaboration between Network Contagion Research Institute and ADL's COE, analyzing the similar ideological motivations and online activity of the perpetrators of the Pittsburgh and Christchurch massacres.⁵⁴ Both killers announced their

⁵⁴ ADL, "Gab and 8Chan: Home to Terrorist Plots Hiding in Plain Sight," April 2019. (<https://www.adl.org/resources/reports/gab-and-8chan-home-to-terrorist-plots-hiding-in-plain-sight>)

violent plans to their preferred internet forums, Gab and 8chan, and were consumed by the white supremacist conspiracy theory of “white genocide,” which is frequently referenced on both sites.

Both Gab and 8chan are rife with white supremacist, hateful, anti-Semitic bigotry. Imageboards such as 4chan are totally anonymous, without user names, allowing participants to say or post whatever they want, no matter how offensive, without fear of being exposed. Many take full advantage to engage in some of the most crude and blatant offensive language online, taking aim at many targets, not sparing even themselves. The chan subculture has a strong tendency to portray all such content as a joke, even when not intended to be, resulting in a strong “jkbnr” (“just kidding but not really”) atmosphere. The alt right has also absorbed an even darker aspect of chan subculture: online harassment campaigns against people who have angered them.

Chans have engaged in such campaigns for years, even against targets as young and innocent as 11-year-old girls. The alt right has used similar tactics against perceived enemies, most notably in late 2016 when neo-Nazi Andrew Anglin initiated a targeted harassment campaign (he called it a “troll storm”) against Tanya Gersh, a Jewish woman and real estate agent from Whitefish, Montana, whom he accused of harassing the mother of another prominent alt right activist, Richard Spencer. Gersh received hundreds of hateful and even threatening e-mails and other communications and was awarded \$14 million in court for the damages incurred from Anglin over the harassment campaign.

The toxicity on social media creates victims online⁵⁵ and online ecosystems that breed real-life hatred. Gab, a self-described “free speech” platform largely used by right wing extremists, has been the preferred platform for hatred and vitriol. Bowers, for example, posted on the site just before he allegedly massacred congregants at the Tree of Life Synagogue in Pittsburgh in October 2017.⁵⁶

Social media platforms such as Twitter consider the best ways to respond to hate and extremism, including by “de-platforming” – or banning users who violate their terms of service – to remove the toxicity on their platforms.⁵⁷ There is some debate around de-platforming and whether it solves or just suppresses hate and extremism and also whether it reduces extremism on one platform that only resurfaces – potentially more virulently – on others.⁵⁸

⁵⁵ ADL, “Quantifying Hate: A Year of Anti-Semitism on Twitter.” (<https://www.adl.org/resources/reports/quantifying-hate-a-year-of-anti-semitism-on-twitter>)

⁵⁶ Anti-Defamation League, “Deadly Shooting at Pittsburgh Synagogue,” *ADL Blog*, October 27, 2018. (<https://www.adl.org/blog/deadly-shooting-at-pittsburgh-synagogue>)

⁵⁷ “No Platform,” *Wikipedia*, updated August 28, 2019. (https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/No_Platform)

⁵⁸ Jason Koebler, “Deplatforming Works,” *VICE*, August 10, 2018. (https://motherboard.vice.com/en_us/article/bjbp9d/do-social-media-bans-work)

Fringe web communities play a critical role in the dissemination of hate and extremist content – particularly /pol (4chan’s politically incorrect message board) and Gab.⁵⁹ At issue is whether Twitter’s solution on its platform may drive the participation and the level of animation of hatred on Gab, implying bans are a solution for one platform but could actually be a detriment to the internet as a whole – potentially reverberating into our everyday lives by exacerbating hate in our communities. There is still much research to be done to reach a firm conclusion on whether and when deplatforming is a highly valuable solution to hate on platforms, but as platform companies calculate their response to online hate and extremism, they need to consider the effects of their decisions on the broader online ecosystem.

Mainstream Social Media

While the most extreme forms of online content thrive on websites like 8chan, Gab, and 4chan, larger social media platforms like Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube need to remain vigilant. Extremists leverage larger mainstream platforms to ensure that the hateful philosophies that begin to germinate on message boards like Gab and 8chan find a new and much larger audience. Twitter’s 300 million users and Facebook’s 2.4 billion dwarf the hundreds of thousands of users on 8chan and Gab. Extremists make use of mainstream platforms in specific and strategic ways to exponentially increase their audience while avoiding content moderation activity that Facebook and Twitter use to remove hateful content. These include creating private pages and events, sharing links that directly lead users to extreme content on websites like 8chan, as well as using coded language called dog whistles to imply and spread hateful ideology.

In response to the 2017 Unite the Right white supremacist rally in Charlottesville, Virginia and subsequent hate crimes by extremists, there have been many well-publicized efforts by mainstream social media companies and internet service providers to stem the tide of hate and extremism online. After the Charlottesville rally, technology companies ranging from large social media platforms like Facebook to payment processors like PayPal and cybersecurity services like Cloudflare took action to expel white supremacists from their services. But these policies have been reactive to incidents and not comprehensive, forcing technology companies to respond to violent white supremacist activity on an ad hoc basis over the last year. The Christchurch massacre was livestreamed on Facebook Live, leading Facebook change their livestreaming policy. PayPal provided payment services to the fringe platform Gab, where the Pittsburgh shooter was radicalized, but cut off their services after the shooting. Cloudflare provided cybersecurity services to 8chan, and publicly withdrew their services after 8chan was blamed for helping to radicalize the perpetrator in the shooting in El Paso (among others). If technology companies took significant action and pursued a sufficiently holistic approach to

⁵⁹ Samantha Cole, “A study of hundreds of millions of images from Reddit, 4chan, Gab, and Twitter reveals how memes spread,” *VICE*, June 12, 2018. (https://motherboard.vice.com/en_us/article/zm884j/where-do-memes-come-from-researchers-studied-reddit-4chan.)

address white supremacy and hate in 2017 as they claim to have done, the services provided by these their platforms would not continually be exploited to target others and spread hate two years later.

A key driver of this problem is scale. For example, on Twitter, 6,000 tweets are posted every second and 500 million tweets are posted every day. If the company's policies and systems operated at 99% effectiveness in detecting and responding to hate and extremism, that would still leave five million tweets unaddressed every day. Imagine that each of those tweets, on the low end, reached just 60 people: those tweets would reach a number of people equal roughly to the population of the United States (330 million people) every day. This being said, the policies and systems of these companies are very likely not operating close to this level of accuracy, leaving untold millions of users impacted by hateful and extreme content every day. As an example, YouTube in June 2019 announced a policy change focusing on prohibiting white nationalist and other extremist content from existing on their platform. Despite the policy change, an ADL investigation in August found that a number of prominent white nationalists and other forms of hateful extremists are still active and easily findable on the platform. Similarly, after Facebook very publicly banned Alex Jones from its platforms in May 2019, Jones very quickly found another way back onto the platform. These instances raise alarming questions about the degree to which traditional social platforms, through their policies and systems, are able to meaningfully detect and address hateful content on the scale at which they're operating.

At the same time, our knowledge on the efficacy of platforms' content moderation efforts at dealing with the problem of white supremacist activity remains extremely limited. We can conduct external research to evaluate their efforts, but companies are not open to sharing user data, limiting opportunities to collect and use data for research. Alternatively, we can review transparency reports on content moderation efforts published by technology companies, but these too offer very limited information.

Mainstream social media platforms have a few potentially relevant metrics to the issue of extremism, especially white supremacist extremism, that they share in their regular transparency reports. Though each platform provides its own metrics on extremist activity, the metrics published are limited across the board, and they are self-reported by the companies, and we have no real way of knowing what content has been put into which category outside of the brief descriptions given by the platforms as part of their reporting.

If we look at the published metrics characterized as being related to terrorism (Facebook reported 6.4 million pieces of content related to terrorist propaganda removed from January to March 2019), this may seem relevant. However, typically, social platforms define terrorism in terms of Al Qaeda and ISIS-related activity and do not include white supremacist violence or activity as part of the terrorism classification. White supremacist extremist content could be categorized as hate speech or violent content on a platform (Twitter reported 250,806 accounts actioned for

hateful conduct and 56,577 accounts actioned for violent threats from July to December 2018), but at the same time, so could a wide variety of other types of content not associated with extremism or white supremacy, so it's hard to gauge based on these metrics either.

Moreover, when Facebook claims in their transparency report that they took action on four million pieces of hate speech from January to March 2019, we still have no sense of how that compares to the level of hate speech reported to them, what communities are impacted by those pieces of content or whether any of that content is connected with extremist activity on their platform. YouTube provides more granularity, sharing a number of different categories of content reported by users as well as the amount of content in each category that YouTube actioned. That being said, the names of the categories actioned by YouTube differs from those reported by users, making a comparison between what is reported and actioned impossible, and providing in the end the same level of opaqueness as Facebook's report.

YouTube's transparency categories for content actioned by the Platform	YouTube's transparency categories for Content reported by users
hateful or abusive	hateful or abusive
harmful or dangerous	harmful dangerous acts
promotion of violence and violent extremism	promotes terrorism
harassment and cyberbullying	
violent or graphic	violent or repulsive
nudity or sexual	sexual
child safety	child abuse
spam, misleading and scams	spam or misleading
other	

Twitter’s transparency report on the other hand provides both the users reported to the platform and users actioned by the platform in identical categories, but it does not provide any information on the amount of content reported versus amount actioned, making the scale of their activity similarly opaque. In order to truly assess the problem of hate on social platforms, technology companies must provide meaningful transparency with metrics that are agreed upon and verified by trusted third parties and that give actionable information to users, civil society, government and other stakeholders.

Meaningful transparency will allow stakeholders to answer questions such as: “How significant is the problem of white supremacy on this platform?” “Is this platform safe for people who belong to my community?” “Have the actions taken by this tech company to improve the problem of hate and extremism on their platform had the desired impact?” Until technology platforms are willing to actively engage external parties and meaningfully address their concerns through greater transparency efforts, our ability to understand the extent of the problem of hate and extremism online, or how to meaningfully and systematically address it, will be extremely limited.

Beyond their community guidelines and content moderation policies, features available on social media platforms need to be designed with anti-hate principles in mind. Companies need to conduct a thoughtful design process that puts their users first and incorporates society’s concerns before, and not after, tragedy strikes. Today, the most popular method of developing technology tools is through a Software Prototyping approach: an industry-wide standard that prompts companies to quickly release a product or feature and iterate on it over time. This approach completely devalues the impact of unintended design consequences. For example, the Christchurch shooter used Facebook’s livestreaming feature to share his attack with the world. The feature could have been designed to limit or lock audiences for new or first-time streamers or prevent easy recording of the video.

Gaming

We are also seeing an increase in extremist content and white supremacist recruitment within online games and gaming forums which are social spaces for video game players. Scholars have observed white supremacist recruiters actively prey on disaffected youth within the gaming community, and use these channels to plant seeds of hate by invoking sentiments of “us versus them”.

Through ADL’s own nationally representative surveys on video games, we found that nearly a quarter of players (23%) are exposed to discussions about white supremacist ideology and almost one in ten (9%) are exposed to discussions about Holocaust denial in online multiplayer games.⁶⁰

⁶⁰ ADL Center for Extremism, *Free to Play?* Anti-Defamation League, July 2019. (<https://www.adl.org/free-to-play>)

These are alarming insights into an industry that has managed to avoid the intense media scrutiny that more traditional social media platforms have experienced.

Podcasting and Video

Despite the alt right's move into the physical world, the internet remains its main propaganda vehicle, but online propaganda involves more than just Twitter and websites. In 2018, podcasting played a particularly outsized role in spreading alt right messages to the world. White supremacists have used videos and audio, both in shorter forms as well as in longer "internet radio" shows or podcasts, for as long as those technologies have been available. Stormfront Radio, for example, dates back to the mid-2000s, and former Klan leader David Duke has long produced videos. However, in the past several years, alt right activists have created an entire universe of alt right-related podcasts (as have their alt lite counterparts), so many that, as one admirer accurately observed recently on the DebateAltRight Reddit forum, "There's really too much for any 1 person to listen to."

Audio and video podcasting have several advantages: Millennial and Generation Z audiences, the prime recruiting pools for much of the alt right, are more likely to engage with these formats than others and more likely to watch or listen to an alt right "show" than read a long alt right ideological screed. Podcasts allow different alt right activists to reach out to people with a variety of styles and approaches to subject matter, building their own audiences—something that is key to the alt right, which doesn't form actual groups as often as some other segments of the white supremacist movement. Moreover, audio podcasts allow alt right activists to maintain the anonymity that most of them desire. The length of alt right podcasts, which can range from around 45 minutes up to three hours, also makes it difficult for anti-racist groups and organizations to thoroughly monitor all such content. Also important is the fact that the de-platforming strategies that have forced prominent white supremacists off many social media, crowdfunding and other platforms have not yet caught up to podcasting, and podcast hosting companies are not necessarily doing their own policing. This means alt right podcasts can be found, sometimes in abundance, on sites such as YouTube, Libsyn, PlayerFM, Spreaker, PodBean and others. This makes it easier for alt right white supremacists to reach audiences with podcasting than through many other platforms.

Indeed, some white supremacists have even built what could be described as alt right media empires. The largest and most influential of these is the website The Right Stuff, run by Mike Peinovich, who uses the pseudonym "Mike Enoch." Peinovich is one of the pioneers of the alt right, beginning his activism through blogging (The Right Stuff itself began as a blog). In 2014, Peinovich began podcasting with what remains one of the longest-running and most popular alt right podcasts, "The Daily Shoah" (its name is anti-Semitic wordplay derived from the comedy television program "The Daily Show" and the Hebrew word "shoah," meaning catastrophe, used

as a synonym for the Holocaust). To date, Peinovich has produced more than 300 episodes of “The Daily Shoah.”

Alt right podcasts can’t get the huge audiences of mainstream podcasts but can attract audiences that are quite large for white supremacists. Red Ice, a white supremacist media company operating both in Sweden and the U.S., for example, has more than 200,000 subscribers on YouTube. The Public Space has more than 40,000 subscribers; Nick Fuentes’ American First podcast has more than 15,000 subscribers. These numbers illustrate the extent to which the alt right relies on its podcasts to get its message out and the degree to which podcast- and video-hosting websites are key to the spread of such messages.

Alt right podcasts also allow alt right activists in the United States to share ideas with their alt right and identitarian counterparts in other countries. For example, British white supremacist Mark Collett has tried to reinvent himself as an observer and commentator on the alt right. He produces a regular podcast on YouTube on which several American white supremacists including Greg Johnson, Tom Kawczynski, Mike Peinovich, aka Mike Enoch, Jared Taylor, Kevin MacDonald and Richard Spencer have appeared. Also, Nils Wegner, a German Identitarian, told the *New York Times* that he had been strongly influenced by the podcasts of Richard Spencer.⁶¹ Wegner went on to conduct the first German-language interview with Spencer.

Moving Forward: Policy Recommendations to Counter the Threat

Bully Pulpit

The President, cabinet officials, and Members of Congress must call out bigotry *at every opportunity*. The right to free speech is a core value, but the promotion of hate should be vehemently rejected. Simply put, you cannot say it enough: America is no place for hate.

Enforcement of Existing Laws

The Administration must send loud, clear, and consistent messages that violent bigotry is unacceptable and ensure that the FBI and the Justice Department’s Civil Rights Division will enforce relevant federal laws and vigorously investigate and prosecute hate crimes.

Improve Federal Hate Crime Training and Data Collection

The Department of Justice should incentivize and encourage state and local law enforcement agencies to more comprehensively collect and report hate crimes data to the FBI, with special attention devoted to large underreporting law enforcement agencies that either have not participated in the FBI Hate Crime Statistics Act program at all or have affirmatively and

⁶¹ James Angelos, “The Prophet of Germany’s New Right,” *The New York Times*, October 10, 2017. (<https://www.nytimes.com/2017/10/10/magazine/the-prophet-of-germanys-new-right.html>)

notcredibly reported zero hate crimes. More comprehensive, complete hate crime reporting can deter hate violence and advance police-community relations.

In addition, the administration, DHS and DoJ should take steps to ensure that it is efficient and safe for all victims of hate crimes to contact the police. If marginalized or targeted community members – including Latinos, immigrants, and people who are perceived to be immigrants, people with disabilities, LGBTQ community members, Muslims, Arabs, Middle Easterners, South Asians and people with limited language proficiency – cannot report, or do not feel safe reporting hate crimes, law enforcement cannot effectively address these crimes, thereby jeopardizing the safety of all.

Legislation to Address White Supremacy and Domestic Terrorism

Congress must act to counter the threat of domestic terrorism and prevent more attacks. No legislative action is perfect, but inaction should not be an option. Congress should enact the following measures:

1. Domestic Terrorism Prevention Act (DTPA) (S. 894/ HR 1931)

This legislation would enhance the federal government’s efforts to prevent domestic terrorism by authorizing into law the offices addressing domestic terrorism, and would require federal law enforcement agencies to regularly assess those threats. The bill would also provide training and resources to assist non-federal law enforcement in addressing these threats, requiring DOJ, DHS, and the FBI to provide training and resources to assist state, local, and tribal law enforcement in understanding, detecting, deterring, and investigating acts of domestic terrorism.

2. Domestic Terrorism Documentation and Analysis of Threats in America (DATA) Act (HR 3106)

Data on extremism and domestic terrorism is being collected by the FBI, but not enough, and the reporting is insufficient and flawed. Data drives policy; we cannot address what we are not measuring. The DATA Act focuses on increasing the coordination, accountability, and transparency of the federal government in collecting and recording data on domestic terrorism.

3. The Khalid Jabara and Heather Heyer National Opposition to Hate, Assault, and Threats to Equality Act (NO HATE Act) of 2019 (S. 2043/ H.R. 3545)

The NO HATE Act would authorize incentive grants to spark improved local and state hate crime training, prevention, best practices, and data collection initiatives – including grants for state hate crime reporting hotlines to direct individuals to local law enforcement and support services.

4. Disarm Hate Act (S.1462/H.R.2708)

This legislation would close the loophole that currently permits the sale of firearms to individuals who have been convicted of threatening a person based on their race, religion, gender, sexual orientation, or disability. The measure would prohibit individuals convicted of a misdemeanor hate crime from obtaining a firearm.

In addition, more consideration is needed for two additional initiatives that could help address white supremacy and domestic terrorism in the United States.

1. Congress should examine whether a rights-protecting domestic terrorism criminal charge is needed – and could be appropriately crafted.

Our federal legal system currently lacks the means to prosecute a white supremacist terrorist as a terrorist. Perpetrators can be prosecuted for weapons charges, acts of violence (including murder), racketeering, hate crimes, or other criminal violations. But we cannot legally prosecute them for what they are: terrorists. Many experts have argued that, without being so empowered, there is a danger that would-be domestic terrorists are more likely to be charged with lesser crimes and subsequently receive lesser sentences. Congress should begin immediate hearings and consultations with legal and policy experts, marginalized communities, and law enforcement professionals on whether it is possible to craft a rights-protecting domestic terrorism statute. Any statute Congress would seriously consider should include specific, careful Congressional and civil liberties oversight to ensure the spirit of such protections are faithfully executed.

2. The State Department should examine whether certain white supremacist groups operating abroad meet the specific criteria to be subject to sanctions under its Designated Foreign Terrorist Organization (FTO) authority.

The criteria, set out in 8 U.S.C. § 1189(a)⁶² are: (1) the organization must be foreign; (2) the organization must engage in terrorist activity or retain the capability and intent to engage in terrorist activity or terrorism; and (3) the terrorist activity or terrorism of the organization must threaten the security of U.S. nationals or the national security of the U.S.

None of the current 68 organizations on the FTO list is a white supremacist organization.⁶³ And while the possibility of designating white supremacist organizations under the State

⁶² “8 U.S. Code § 1189. Designation of foreign terrorist organizations,” Cornell Law School Legal Information Institute, accessed September 16, 2019; (<https://www.law.cornell.edu/uscode/text/8/1189>)

⁶³ State Department, “Foreign Terrorist Organizations,” accessed September 16, 2019; (<https://www.state.gov/foreign-terrorist-organizations/>)

Department's FTO authority holds promise, there are some important considerations that must be taken into account.

First, while several countries have added white supremacist groups to their own designated terrorist lists in recent days – including Canada⁶⁴ and England⁶⁵ – white supremacist groups do not operate exactly like other FTOs, such as ISIS and al-Qaeda. For example, individual white supremacists that carry out attacks – wherever they are – very rarely receive specific operational instructions from organized white supremacist groups abroad to carry out these attacks. These groups generally do not have training camps in Europe or elsewhere where individuals travel to learn tactics and then return home to carry out an attack. Instead, individuals in the United States are typically motivated to act based on their own white supremacist ideology, which primarily stems from domestic sources of inspiration but which can sometimes also stem from inspirational sources abroad – including the violent actions of white supremacists – whether that foreign source is associated with an organization or not.

Second, in the United States, unlike in Canada and England, the First Amendment provides unique, broad protection for even the most vile hate speech and propaganda. While clearly criminal conduct would not be protected under the First Amendment, a great deal of non-criminal association, speech, and hateful propaganda would be protected speech. The First Amendment's assembly and speech protections would not permit designation of white supremacist organizations operating here, but designating *foreign* white supremacist groups could make knowingly providing material support or resources to them a crime – extending authority for law enforcement officials to investigate whether such a crime is being planned or is occurring.⁶⁶

Addressing Online Hate and Harassment

1. Strengthen laws against perpetrators of online hate

Hate and harassment translate from on the ground to online spaces, including in social media and games, but our laws have not kept up. Many forms of severe online misconduct are not consistently covered by cybercrime, harassment, stalking and hate crime law. Congress has an opportunity to lead the fight against cyberhate by increasing protections for targets as well as

⁶⁴ Harmeet Kaur, "For the first time, Canada adds white supremacists and neo-Nazi groups to its terror organization list," *CNN*, June 28, 2018, (<https://www.cnn.com/2019/06/27/americas/canada-neo-nazi-terror-organization-list-trnd/index.html>)

⁶⁵ Emma Lake, "Terror Crackdown: Which terror groups are banned under UK law and when was National Action added to the list?" *The Sun (UK)*, October 26, 2017 (<https://www.thesun.co.uk/news/4569388/banned-terror-groups-uk-national-action>)

⁶⁶ Mary B. McCord, "White Nationalist Killers Are Terrorists. We Should Fight Them Like Terrorists," *Washington Post*, Aug. 8, 2019, (https://www.washingtonpost.com/outlook/white-nationalist-killers-are-terrorists-we-should-fight-them-like-terrorists/2019/08/08/3f8b761a-b964-11e9-bad6-609f75bfd97f_story.html)

penalties for perpetrators of online misconduct. Some actions Congress can take include revising Federal law to allow for penalty enhancements based on cyber-related conduct; updating federal stalking and harassment statutes' intent requirement to account for online behavior; and legislating specifically on cybercrimes such as doxing, swatting, non-consensual pornography, and deepfakes.

2. Urge social media platforms to institute robust governance

Government officials have an important role to play in encouraging social media platforms to institute robust and verifiable industry-wide self-governance. This could take many forms, including Congressional oversight or passing laws that require certain levels of transparency and auditing. The internet plays a vital role in allowing for innovation and democratizing trends, and that should be preserved. At the same time the ability to use it for hateful and severely harmful conduct needs to be effectively addressed.

3. Improve training of law enforcement

Law enforcement is a key responder to online hate, especially in cases when users feels they are in imminent danger. Increasing resources and training for these departments is critical to ensure they can effectively investigate and prosecute cyber cases and that targets know they will be supported if they contact law enforcement.

Platform Responsibility to Address Online Hate and Harassment

1. Terms of Service

Every social media and online game platform must have clear terms of service that address hateful content and harassing behavior, and clearly define consequences for violations. These policies should state that the platform will not tolerate hateful content or behavior on the basis of protected characteristics. They should prohibit abusive tactics such as harassment, doxing and swatting. Platforms should also note what the process of appeal is for users who feel their content was flagged as hateful or abusive in error.

2. Responsibility and Accountability.

Social media and online game platforms should assume greater responsibility to enforce their policies and to do so accurately at scale. They should improve the complaint process so that it provides a more consistent and speedy resolution for targets. They should lessen the burden of the complaint process for users, and instead proactively, swiftly, and continuously addressing hateful content using a mix of artificial intelligence and humans who are fluent in the relevant language and knowledgeable in the social and cultural context of the relevant community.

Additionally, given the prevalence of online hate and harassment, platforms should offer far more services and tools for individuals facing or fearing online attack. They should provide greater filtering options that allow individuals to decide for themselves how much they want to see likely hateful comments. They should consider the experience of individuals who are being harassed in a coordinated way, and be able to provide aid to these individuals in meaningful ways. They should allow users to speak to a person as part of the complaint process in certain, clearly defined cases. They should provide user-friendly tools to help targets preserve evidence and report problems to law enforcement and companies.

3. Governance and Transparency.

Perhaps most importantly, social media and online game platforms should adopt robust governance. This should include regularly scheduled external, independent audits so that the public knows the extent of hate and harassment on a given platform. Audits should also allow the public to verify that the company followed through on its stated actions and assess the effectiveness of company efforts over time. Companies should provide information from the audit and elsewhere through more robust transparency reports. Finally, companies should create independent groups of experts from relevant stakeholders, including civil society, academia and journalism, to help provide guidance and oversight of platform policies.

Beyond their own community guidelines, transparency efforts and content moderation policies, features available on social media and online game platforms need to be designed with anti-hate principles in mind. Companies need to conduct a thoughtful design process that puts their users first, and incorporates risk and radicalization factors before, and not after, tragedy strikes. Today, the most popular method of developing technology tools is through a Software Prototyping approach: an industry-wide standard that prompts companies to quickly release a product or feature and iterate on it over time. This approach completely devalues the impact of unintended design consequences. For example, the Christchurch shooter used Facebook's livestreaming feature to share his attack with the world. The feature could have been designed to limit or lock audiences for new or first-time streamers or prevent easy recording of the video.

These kinds of attacks, designed to leverage social media to attract maximum attention and encourage the next attack, force us to reassess the threat of hateful echo chambers like 8chan as well as the exploitable features in mainstream platforms like Facebook — and how they help drive extremist violence.

Thank you for the opportunity to testify and for calling a hearing on this topic. The scourge of white supremacy is vile, dangerous, and an imminent threat to our communities and those of our partners abroad. We must act swiftly, decisively and comprehensively to counter this threat and prevent it from metastasizing. On behalf of the ADL, we look forward to working with you as you continue to devote your urgent attention to the issue.